

**MINUTES OF MEETING
State Heritage Register Committee**

Wednesday 4th March 2009
Commencing at 10.20 am

Heritage Branch – Department of Planning
Heritage Branch Library
3 Marist Place
Parramatta



1.0 Attendance

PRESENT Gabrielle Kibble (Acting Chair)
Michael Clarke
Russell Couch
Rosemary Annable
Ross Fitzgerald

APOLOGIES Sharon Sullivan
Tina Jackson
Danny Chapman

**ALSO IN ATTENDANCE
(Heritage Branch)** Cameron White
Graham Williams
Patricia Hale
Bronwyn Hanna
Louise Thom
Bill Nethery
Stewart Watters

Opening – Welcome

The Acting Chair opened the meeting at 10:20 am.

2.0 Declarations of Interest

Nil

3.0 Confirmation of Minutes

The Minutes were confirmed subject to an amendment to Item 6.0 Presentations – Discussion with Hector Abrahams, Chair of the Religious Property Advisory Panel. Members noted that it had been agreed that RPAP would prepare a strategy for the listing of religious properties, taking into consideration issues such as identifying significant religious heritage buildings and representing the works of prominent architects.

4.0 Action Report

The Action Report was noted. Comment was raised on the number of items, dating back several years, which have been included in the Action Report. Cameron White advised that a review of these items would be undertaken. Verbal updates of the following two issues from the December 2008 Committee meeting were made to the Committee:

- **Alunite Mine** It has been confirmed that the mine site is not on the Forests NSW (Department of Primary Industries) Section 170 Register.
 - **Boatman's Terrace, Newcastle** It has been confirmed that Boatman's Terrace is included in the Department of Housing Section 170 Register. Negotiations have been commenced between the Heritage Branch and the Department of Housing.
-

5.0 Minutes, reports and matters arising from HC Advisory Panels

Nil

6.0 Presentations

Donald Ellsmore: Vernacular Barns at risk in the Hawkesbury

Mr Ellsmore gave the committee a presentation, with photographs of representative structures, of timber barns which has considered to be at risk in the Hawkesbury district. Mr Ellsmore gave his view that new planning code requirements represented a new potential threat to the survival of old barns, no longer in regular use.

It was stated that a study to assess the number of such barns, their heritage significance and to form a management strategy is required. It was noted that Hawkesbury Council had not undertaken a study to aid the understanding of the historical and structural context of surviving barns. Mr Ellsmore considered that it would be likely that some barns would be State significant.

The question was raised by the Committee as to how many such barns may be in public ownership, such as council or on National Park lands. Mr Ellsmore stated that he was aware of the Hawkesbury Council ownership of a barn next to Tebutt's Observatory. He was unaware of any barns within National Parks lands.

After the presentation questions were raised by the Committee as to the practicality of adaptation of old barns for new uses and issues of conservation and stabilisation. Comment was made that many surviving barns appear to date from the latter part of the 19th Century and early 20th Century.

The Committee agreed that it is a reasonable proposition for a thematic study to be made of floodplain barns in the Penrith, Hawkesbury, Hunter and Central West areas.

7.0 State Heritage Register – Notice of intention to list - Draft Nominations

7.1 Draft Nominations for Review

Seven Nominations were submitted to the Committee for consideration.

Sydney Day Care Nursery, 126 Dowling Street, Woolloomooloo

Bronwyn Hanna introduced the Committee to the nomination for the Sydney Day Care Nursery.

The property at 126 Dowling Street, Woolloomooloo was nominated by SDN Children's Services, as the location of the first crèche used by this organisation. It was used as a crèche for the children of poor working mothers between 1905 and 1908 before larger premises were acquired.

The property is an 1880s terrace house dating from 1880s and is listed on the as a local heritage item on the Sydney Local Environmental Plan for its streetscape value as part of the longest remaining terrace row in Woolloomooloo. The property is owned by the Department of Housing. That Department recently placed a plaque on the property to commemorate its historical role in the history of childcare.

Committee members enquired whether the property is on the Department of Housing Section 170 Register. The presence of the public plaque recording the property's use as a crèche in the early 1900s was noted and comment was made as to whether this plaque provided an appropriate level of public recognition other than a State Heritage Register listing.

Several examples of earlier 19th Century child care centres were noted by Committee members with reference made to an early centre being established at St James Church. The Committee agreed that further research on the significance of 126 Dowling Street in the history of child care was needed with the nominator to be asked for further information.

Bill Nethery introduced the following five Newcastle items.

Wickham Superior School (former), Newcastle

The former Wickham Superior School, constructed between 1904 and 1906 in the Federation Arts and Craft style was the first Government school to be constructed following the 1903 public education reforms. The Wickham Superior School became the model design used after that time.

The Committee was advised that the former school building is now owned by Newcastle city Council and is used for University Student accommodation. The Committee was advised of a proposal for the City Council to divest itself of the building to Newcastle University.

The Committee agreed to defer further consideration of the heritage significance of the former Wickham Superior School pending further information being researched. In particular, the Committee recommended the Heritage Branch liaise with the Government Architects Office to gain a better assessment of the comparative significance of the building.

Coutts Sailors' Home, Newcastle

The Committee was advised that a Section 60 development proposal for the former Coutts Sailors' Home was considered by the Heritage Council's Approvals Committee at its February 2009 meeting. At that meeting the Approval Committee resolved to defer consideration of the application to seek further information and to request the applicant to consider amendments to the scheme.

The proposed development consists of five stages including the subdivision, refurbishment and construction of residences on land that is contained within the SHR curtilage for the Convict Lumber Yard Archaeological site in Newcastle. The SHR Committee was advised that the State Heritage Register listing for the Convict Lumber Yard Archaeological site includes a portion of the present Coutts Sailors' Home and Superintendent's Residence sites.

The Newcastle Local Environmental Plan 2008 identified the former Coutts Sailors' home as having state significance.

The Committee was advised that the condition of the main fabric of the building was much better than the photographs viewed by the Committee, in the discussion, would appear to indicate. The Committee considered that more recent photographs of the building are needed.

The Committee recommended that the issue of State Heritage Register listing of Coutts Sailors' Home should be considered by the whole Heritage Council in view of the listing and development proposals involving both Heritage Council Committees.

Leslieville, Newcastle

Leslieville was built in the Italianate style in 1875 for William Arnott and occupied by the Arnott family as a residence until 1900 then as offices until 1968. Leslieville was nominated as one of few sites remaining in NSW associated with both the personal and business life of William Arnott and the Arnott's Biscuit Empire. The house retains much of its period construction in its external form and fabric, as well as some original internal features, including staircase and joinery.

After consideration the Committee agreed that Leslieville is of local significance.

Christ Church Cathedral, Park and Cemetery, Newcastle

The site of Christ Church Cathedral has a long and continuous association with Australia's religious history, being the site of one of the earliest churches and European burial grounds in Australia.

Christ Church is as an excellent example of the Victorian Academic Gothic style and is the largest and most ambitious ecclesiastical work one of Australia's most influential architects, J Horbury-Hunt. From its situation atop Church Hill it is a Newcastle landmark, visually dominating Newcastle's city centre and defining its skyline.

The cemetery is one of the earliest European burial sites established in NSW and one of the few that remain undeveloped and accessible.

It was noted in the Committee's discussion of the nomination that the Cathedral had received much restoration work following the December 1989 Newcastle Earthquake with an engineering award made for the standard of the restoration.

Members agreed that Christ Church Cathedral, its Park and Cemetery are likely to be of State Heritage significance.

Toll Cottage (formerly Rose Cottage), Newcastle

Toll Cottage was nominated as an example of the earliest Colonial Georgian housing stock, still surviving in an urban setting and as the oldest surviving dwelling in Newcastle.

Toll Cottage is a modest Colonial Georgian dwelling reportedly constructed in the late 1820s. The Committee was advised that the property is in private ownership and is occupied by a law office. The property is listed as a local item on the Newcastle Local Environmental Plan.

Member agreed that the local listing is an appropriate level of heritage listing for Toll Cottage. Members noted the likely date of construction had not been established clearly in the nomination.

The Ben Hall Track (Six sites)

Louise Thom introduced the following serial listing nomination proposal and the Committee viewed photographs of the various location.

The six Ben Hall Track sites are:

Escort Rock was the site of a large gold robbery, organised by notorious bushranger Frank Gardiner, and the first robbery with which Ben Hall can definitely be linked.

Cliefden A 19th century sheep station that was renowned for its thoroughbred horses. In 1863 Hall's gang raided the station to steal quality horses, essential to their bushranging and superior to police horses. The property curtilage contains an 1842 homestead, an 1842 barn and woolshed and a family cemetery. The homestead demonstrates fortification against attacks by bushrangers.

Wandi, (formerly Plumb's Inn) An 1840's former hotel which was the site of resistance to an attack by the Ben Hall gang in 1864.

Bushranger Hotel, (formerly Kimberley's Commercial Hotel). Circa 1860. In 1865 Ben Hall's gang raided the hotel and held a number of people hostage. Police Constable Nelson engaged one of the bushrangers in a gun fight during the raid and lost his life. A memorial to Constable Nelson is adjacent to the hotel.

Ben Hall's Death Site commemorates the place where Hall was shot dead by police on 5 May 1865. It is significant in the romanticisation of Ben Hall.

Ben Hall's Grave is located in Forbes general cemetery the grave is marked by a white headstone and picket fence.

Committee members raised the question as to whether the items were part of an established tourist track. It was noted that whilst several sites, such as Ben Hall's death site and grave

are sites regularly visited by tourists the six sites forming the nomination are not an established tourist track. It was also noted that Escort Rock and the Bushranger Hotel are readily accessible for tourists, however the two homesteads, Cliefden and Wandii, were noted as not being readily publicly accessible and are in private ownership. In view of the differences in public accessibility it was suggested that serial listing proposal be known as "Ben Hall sites" rather than as a "Track" for the inference that such a term may bring in public perception of equal access to the six sites.

Member agreed that the serial listing proposal was of State heritage significance, but that further work was required to emphasise the relevant historical themes.

Resolved

That the State Heritage Register Committee:

1. Advises the Heritage Branch about the likely level of heritage significance for each of the above nominated items.

8.0 State Heritage Register – Recommendations to Minister

As an introduction to the following two items regarding WWI & WWII and Governor Macquarie listing themes Cameron White advised the Committee of the public launch of the Thematic Listings Program by the Hon Kristina Keneally MP, Minister for Planning, at the Hyde Park Barracks on Friday, 27th February 2009. A photographic review of the launch was displayed to the Committee.

Cameron White further advised the Committee that a report would be prepared for the Committee's April meeting on progress on the backlog of nominations.

8.1 Progress of World War I and World War II listings theme

The issue considered by the Committee was the recommendation for endorsement of the Listing Team's approach and initial priority list of WWI & WWII associated nominations. Twenty five sites and items were recommended for the initial priority list and these are described in the following table.

ANZAC Memorial, Hyde Park	Sydney
Lithgow Small Arms Factory	Lithgow
HMAS Sydney memorial mast	Mosman
Repatriation Hospital Concord (Stephenson & Turner)	Canada Bay
Berrima canoes	Berrima
Glen Davis shale mine and factory	Lithgow
Yooroonah tank traps	Armidale Dumaresq
William Dawes (USA Liberty shipwreck) in ocean off Tathra	Unincorporated
Abercrombie House	Bathurst
Trial Bay Gaol	Kempsey
Holsworthy	Sutherland / Liverpool

Chowder Bay military complex including hutted hospital	Mosman
Duration housing in either St Marys, Lithgow or Orange	Penrith, Lithgow or Orange
Newington Armaments Depot	Auburn
Fighter Sector HQ Bunker (Allied Works Council)	Bankstown
Coastal batteries and complexes at either North Head, Newcastle or Wollongong	Manly, Newcastle or Wollongong
Lithgow (inland) batteries	Lithgow
Tocumwal Hangars	Berrigan
Emden Gun, Hyde Park	Sydney
Cenotaph, Martin Place	Sydney
Scheyville National Park	Hawkesbury
Orchard Hills Ammunition Depot	Penrith
Royal Edward Victualling Yard Pyrmont	Sydney
Aboriginal site TBA	?
Civilian air raid shelter TBA	?

Cameron White advised the Committee of the preparation of a letter to the President of the Returned Services League (RSL) to notify the RSL of the inclusion of World Wars I and II in the Thematic Listing Theme Program.

Resolved

That the State Heritage Register Committee:

- 1) Endorses the priority list of sites (at Annexure D) to form the basis of a work plan under the World War I and II theme in 2009-2010.**

8.2 Progress of Governor Macquarie listings theme

Proposed priority list of 12 sites to be progressed for listing in 2009-10 under the Governor Macquarie theme

The Committee was advised that the 30 sites had been initially identified as being associated with Lachlan Macquarie's Governorship of NSW. An expert group had researched the sites in reference to Governor Macquarie's July 1822 report to Earl Bathurst of noted public works undertaken during his governorship. The agenda papers contained a table of the 30 study sites.

The recommendation was made to the Committee that it endorses the Listing Team's priority list of 12 nominations for SHR listing under the Governor Macquarie theme for 2009-10. The Committee was advised that the 12 nominated sites were short-listed, as priority sites, from the selection of 30 sites by the expert group.

The twelve priority nominated sites are:

1. NSW Conservatorium of Music, Sydney (Greenway's stables to First Government House)
2. St John's Anglican Provisional Cathedral, Church Street, Parramatta

3. Site of the former Market Place, now Town Hall Square, between Parramatta Town Hall and St John's Cathedral, Church Street, Parramatta
4. Site of the Government Naval Dockyard, currently car park, proposed site of MCA extension, West Circular Quay, Sydney
5. Macquarie Place Precinct, Sydney
6. Glenroy, Jenolan Caves Road, Hartley (confluence of River Lett & Cox's River)
7. Former Market Square, now Richmond Park, Richmond
8. Macquarie Watchtower, La Perouse Monuments Historic Site
9. 1819 Temporary chapel and school house building, in the grounds of St John's Anglican Church, Macquarie Road, Wilberforce
10. 1790s Wilberforce Cemetery, adjacent to St John's Church
11. Site of the Commissariat Stores, now First Fleet Park, West Circular Quay, Sydney
12. Lancer Barracks, Smith Street, Parramatta (Commonwealth-owned)

ALTERNATIVELY

12. Commandant's House, Government House/Cottage, George Street, Windsor

The Commandant's House at Windsor was provided as an alternative to the Lancer Barracks as it was noted that the Lancer Barracks is a Commonwealth Government site, with advice accordingly required from the Crown Solicitor on the application of the Heritage Act to Commonwealth property.

Mention was made by Committee members that the above priority nominated sites did not include Mrs Macquarie's Road and Mrs Macquarie's Chair and Macquarie items in the Royal Botanic Gardens, the Macquarie Street ceremonial thoroughfare, all in Sydney and Cox's Road in the Blue Mountains. The committee was advised in regard to these mentioned Sydney items that the twelve priority nominations were selected from the Macquarie 1822 report.

Reference was also made in the discussion to the former (west Circular Quay) dockyards which were located near Cadman's Cottage and the grounds of the current Museum of Contemporary Art. It was noted that these former dockyards had been begun by the Second Governor, Captain John Hunter, and extended under Macquarie's governorship to their maximum form. The Committee was advised of a Management Plan for First Fleet Park (adjoining the Museum of Contemporary Art) and that the archaeology of the site is being discussed in association with proposed extensions of the Museum.

Several other NSW sites, such as Bathurst, Newcastle and Liverpool Hospital associated with Macquarie were also mentioned by Committee members. The Committee was advised that Newcastle and Liverpool Hospital were under research in the Thematic Listing Program's parallel Convict category. The Committee indicated its wish that the Heritage Branch also look at Macquarie associated sites outside of the Sydney Metropolitan area.

The Committee suggested that a Heritage Council publication be organised in commemoration of the 2010 Bi-centenary of the appointment of Lachlan Macquarie as Governor of NSW.

The Committee also noted the desirability of a form of public recognition, other than heritage listing, of the importance of the town planning of the "Macquarie Towns" undertaken during Macquarie's Governorship.

Resolved

That the State Heritage Register Committee:

1. **Endorses the priority list of sites (at Annexure B) as the basis of a work program for listings on the SHR under the Governor Macquarie 1810–1821 theme in 2009-2010.**
2. **Requests the Heritage Branch review listing priorities and advise the committee of such, depending on community nominations received.**

9.0 State Government Heritage

9.1 Sydney Ports Corporation S170 Heritage and Conservation Register

The Committee considered the Sydney Ports Corporation *Heritage and Conservation Register*, (pursuant to s.170(6) of the *Heritage Act 1977*) for endorsement. A copy of the Register was tabled at the meeting for the information of Members. The Committee agreed to endorse the Sydney Ports Corporation the s.170 *Heritage and Conservation Register* and made the following resolution.

Resolved

That the State Heritage Register Committee:

1. **Endorses the current Sydney Ports Corporation s.170 *Heritage and Conservation Register*;**
2. **Requests the Heritage Branch to review and consider those items identified as State significant for possible listing on the State Heritage Register when in line with an identified theme;**
3. **Recommends that Sydney Ports Corporation publish their s.170 Register on their website within the existing “environmental” pages; and**
4. **Writes to the Managing Director, Sydney Ports Corporation congratulating the entity on its initiatives in implementing key strategic heritage actions under the NSW *Heritage Act 1977*, and in its proposed approach to integrated heritage management.**

9.2 Energy Australia, Application under Section 57(2) - Site Specific Exemptions

A suite of 15 site specific exemptions for Energy Australia’s 12 SHR-listed properties was presented to the SHR Committee for its endorsement. The Committee was advised that the site specific exemptions are to obviate the need for Energy Australia to seek Heritage Council approvals when undertaking the replacement and maintenance of non-original equipment, minor repair works and addressing health and safety matters. The Committee agreed to the following resolution.

Resolved

That the State Heritage Register Committee in accordance with section 57(2) of the Heritage Act, 1977 recommends to the Minister that she:

- A. **Grant exemption from Heritage Council approval under Section 57(1) of the Heritage Act for the following activities described in 2.1–15 below for Energy Australia’s 12 SHR-listed substations, noted below:**

Item Name No.	Address	Suburb	LGA	Listing
Electricity Power House	23 Albany Street	Crows Nest	North Sydney	00931
Relay Test Centre	11 St Davids Road	Haberfield	Ashfield	00933
Substation	41 Mountain Street	Ultimo	Sydney	00934
Substation	60 Bundock Lane	Randwick	Randwick	00935
Substation	83 Griffiths Street	Balgowlah	Manly	00936
Substation	34a-36 Whistler Street	Manly	Manly	00938
Substation	1 Young Street	Paddington	Woollahra	00939
Substation	982-984 Pacific Highway	Pymble	Ku-Ring-Gai	00940
Substation	182 Johnston Street	Annandale	Leichhardt	00941
Electricity Substation No 167 Auburn	01790	93 Parramatta Road		Auburn
Electricity Substation No 269 Waverley	01791	36 Anglesea Street		Bondi
Electricity Substation No 349 Randwick	01792	2A Frances Street		Randwick

B. Grant exemption from Heritage Council approval under Section 57(1) of the Heritage Act for the following activities described in 1–15 below, subject to review and approval by a person with demonstrated heritage expertise and experience in similar buildings and sites.

- 1) Replacement of corrugated asbestos roofing systems, box gutters and eaves with corrugated metal roofing system which maintains the general profile of the building roof and does not require replacement of structural fabric of the roof and retains any decorative features of the original roof design (e.g. exposed eaves, decorative soffits or barge boards). The choice of roofing material should not preclude the reinstatement of the original form of rainwater goods.
- 2) Replacement of non-original switchgear and associated internal building rearrangements to accommodate new switchgear, which does not require the significant removal of building fabric.
- 3) Replacement of non-original internal and external transformers.
- 4) Internal installation of fire mitigation apparatus and mechanisms including fire curtains, sheeting of structural members to improve fire rating and replacement of internal fire doors with asbestos cores.
- 5) Minor works necessary to preserve and enhance the security of the building including the replacement of locks, installation of internal security screens and grilles and the installation of electronic access control devices.
- 6) Maintenance and minor repairs that are necessary to preserve and maintain the building and are within the limits of the standard exemptions of the Heritage Act.
- 7) Excavations and reinstatement associated with installation or replacement of conduits, cables, services and pipes, where this will occur within existing cable egress areas or existing cable jointing areas and there are no known or suspected archaeological relics.
- 8) Minor works internal to the building including:
 - a) Replacement of Customer Load Control Equipment.
 - b) Upgrade of non-original toilet / washroom facilities.
 - c) Upgrade of control room equipment.
 - d) Refurbishment of battery rooms.
 - e) The removal of asbestos materials such as interior and external sheet linings, fire proofing, troughing, conduits, window sealant, asbestos fire doors etc.

- f) **The removal of devices and equipment containing mercury or other heavy metals.**
- g) **Removal of lead-based paint and reinstatement with the original paint scheme.**
- h) **Replacement of non-original lighting fixtures, including electrical controls where they are required for security or safety.**
- 9) **Minor internal works necessary to upgrade and enhance the structural integrity of the building which do not impact on the heritage significance of the building including:**
 - a) **The internal fitting of improved handrails and or stairs to access higher stories for the reason of safe access.**
 - b) **The upgrade of non-original internal lifting / crane equipment in loading docks specifically required for manual handling of equipment to meet WorkCover requirements.**
- 10) **Temporary works including containment areas, scaffolding and enclosures necessary for the carrying out of maintenance, enhancement or upgrading works.**
- 11) **Installation of safety or information signs, not being for commercial or advertising purposes.**
- 12) **Maintenance and painting of finished building surfaces where colour of finish is matched to the original colour.**
- 13) **Decommissioning of a substation and removal of non-original equipment.**

Installation of oil containment systems in order to meet NSW EPA Pollution Licence requirements, in the following circumstances:

 - a) **Masonry or concrete bunding around transformers and within existing transformer bays.**
 - b) **Underground oil containment works or systems in areas where there are no known or suspected archaeological relics.**
- 14) **Ventilation and air conditioning works limited to:**
 - a) **Replacement of existing external vents and louvres in a style consistent with the external appearance of the building.**
 - b) **Replacement of non-mechanical rooftop ventilators in a style consistent with the form, scale and position of existing ventilators.**
 - c) **Internal air conditioning systems with no externally visible components and which do not require the removal of original building fabric.**

10.0 Interim Heritage Orders

"Peroomba" 11 Hastings Avenue, Warrawee (Ku-ring-gai Council)

A late "Green Paper" was tabled at the meeting for a request for an Interim Heritage Order to be made on "Peroomba". On 27th November 2008, Clive Lucas, from Clive Lucas, Stapleton & Partners Pty Ltd, requested an Interim Heritage Order be made on 'Peroomba', a property at 11 Hastings Avenue, Warrawee. The significance of this property, whether it is at a State or local level, is yet to be determined.

The Committee was advised that Peroomba, a residence designed in the Georgian style, was commissioned in 1938 by Sir Victor and Lady Windeyer to be built by William Laurie, a distinguished Australian architect and the brother-in-law of Lady Windeyer. Following the death of Lady Windeyer in 2008, the residence and property was sold by the Windeyer children. Since the sale of the property concerns have been raised with Heritage Branch by the nominator and Ku-ring-gai Council that the property may be proposed for subdivision/redevelopment.

It was noted that the property is not listed as a local heritage item on the Ku-ring-gai Local Environmental Plan.

The Committee considered that there is not an urgent need for a recommendation to be made to the Minister regarding an Interim Heritage Order and that further research on the significance of the property is needed. The Committee requested the Heritage Branch to make enquiries to Ku-ring-gai Council as to the possible local; listing status for the property. It was noted that Ms Zeny Edwards had undertaken research on the local area.

Resolved

That the State Heritage Register Committee:

- 1. Requests the Heritage Branch to carry out further research on the likely level of heritage significance of Peroomba;**
- 2. Request the Heritage Branch to liaise with Ms Zeny Edwards on the comparative heritage significance of Peroomba.**

11.0 Environmental Planning Instruments & Heritage Studies

Nil

12.0 Matters for Consideration

Nil

13.0 General Business

There being no further business the Chair closed the meeting closed at 12:45 PM

Next Meeting of the Heritage Council State Heritage Register Committee

Wednesday 1st April 2009
Heritage Branch – Department of Planning
Heritage Branch Library
3 Marist Place
Parramatta

Minutes endorsed by the Heritage Council State Heritage Register Committee.	<hr/> Chair, State Heritage Register Committee Date:
---	---