

MINUTES OF MEETING

State Heritage Register Committee

Wednesday October 3rd, 2007
Commencing at 2:00 pm

Meeting Room 119 Level 1
Department of Planning,
23-33 Bridge Street Sydney



1.0 Attendance

PRESENT

Sharon Sullivan
Michael Clarke
Rosemary Annable
Tina Jackson
Robert Goodman (for Jason Ardler)

APOLOGIES

Hewitt Whyman
Professor Ross Fitzgerald
John Robertson
Jason Ardler
Reece McDougall

ALSO IN ATTENDANCE Cameron White
(Heritage Office) Perpetual Fernandes

Opening – Welcome

The Chair opened the meeting at 2:00 pm.

2.0 Declarations of Interest

Nil

3.0 Confirmation of Minutes

The minutes of the previous meeting held September 5th, 2007 were noted and adopted by the Committee.

Moved Michael Clarke
Seconded Tina Jackson

4.0 Action Report

The Action Report was noted by Members. Members were advised that the Heritage Office had received a significant number of submissions on Currawong, about 300. Given the number of submissions received, the public comment period had been extended under delegation to the 12th October 2007.

5.0 Minutes, reports and matters arising from HC Advisory Panels

Nil

6.0 Presentations

Nil

7.0 Nominations Review

7.1 State Heritage Register Nominations

The Members made comment on the 16 nominations to the State Heritage Register which were referred for review.

1. St. Mary's Tower, Douglas Park

- This was nominated by Heritage Advisor Jennifer Lambert Tracey on behalf of the owner, The Missionaries of the Sacred Heart.
- The LGA is Wollondilly
- The item is a complex of religious and residential facilities, surrounding the 1844, Edmund Blacket designed, residence of Surveyor-General, Sir Thomas Mitchell
- It was noted that the owners supported the nomination.

Comment

Members agreed that the item is potentially of State Significance. The nomination however needs more research to fully justify its State heritage significance. Members noted that a Conservation Management Plan (CMP) was in progress for the site. Members recommended that the Office supplement the nomination with information from the CMP, when complete.

2. Cathedral Church of St Saviour Precinct, Goulburn

- This item was nominated by the Dean of Goulburn The Very Reverend Phillip Saunders.
- The LGA is Goulburn- Mulwaree
- The curtilage is not specified but includes the Cathedral which was designed by Edmund Blacket in 1874, the Parish Hall, the Cathedral Office and the precinct's landscaping.

Comment

Members agreed that the item is of State Significance and that the Cathedral was one of Blacket's greatest works. Members agreed that archaeology needed particular attention.

3. Old Pambula Rifle Range

- This item was nominated by a community member.
- The LGA is Bega Valley.
- The range dates from 1921 and is approximately 540 metres in length.
- The site is now located within Ben Boyd National Park.
- The former range is now overgrown with vegetation.

- No evidence remains of a small weatherboard and slab hut which once stood on the site.
- The “stop butt” remains in-situ – a large earth built mound, approximately 3 to 3.5 metres high and 25 metres in length.

Comment

Members considered that not enough information had been provided to justify State heritage significance. Members agreed that the item may be of local significance.

4. Alumy Creek Reserve, Grafton

- This item was nominated by the Trustees of Crown Reserve.
- The LGA is Clarence Valley
- The curtilage contains a one room school, teacher’s residences, an arboretum and sportsground.
- The complex operates as a museum

Comment

Members enquired whether the building was listed as a heritage item on Council’s LEP. Members expressed some uncertainty regarding the site’s rarity. The Chair agreed to talk to members of the local community about the heritage significance of the site. The Committee recommended that the matter be discussed with Dr Lionel Gilbert who is an expert in this area, regarding the site’s rarity and heritage significance. Members decided defer a decision on the significance of this nomination pending further investigations.

5. Port of Wentworth

- This item was nominated by Wentworth Council
- The town was established in 1840.
- The nomination is for a precinct within the town.
- The land is in mixed tenure - owned by the Council and private owners.
- The private owners are not aware of the nomination at this time.
- Some elements of the town are listed on the local LEP and the State Heritage Register as heritage items, however no conservation areas are listed on the LEP.

Comment

It was acknowledged by the Committee that Wentworth has been important to the historical development of the Darling and Murray Rivers. Members also agreed that the town of Wentworth is an important cultural landscape. Members felt the town is relatively intact.

While agreeing the area was of potential State heritage significance, the Committee considered that the nomination contains insufficient detail to enable review as a State Heritage Register item. The Committee considers there is a need to update the nomination as it is based on a 1993 study.

Members recommended that the Heritage Office confirm whether Council retained a Heritage Advisor. It was recommended that the Heritage Office write to the Council, confirm that view that the area was of potential State heritage significance, see if Council was still interested in pursuing the nomination and to request the nomination be enhanced. Members also recommended that the Office talk to Council’s Heritage Advisor if one existed.

The Members deferred a decision on the nomination pending the submission of the additional information by Council.

6. RAAF/RAN Ammunition Depot conservation Area

- This item was nominated by Penrith City Council and owned by the Commonwealth.
- It was used during World War II as a storage facility for ammunition and ordnance.
- The item nominated as an area of 1270 hectares constituting a landscape described as "the least disturbed and largest remaining remnant of Cumberland Plain Woodlands and Sydney Coastal River Flat Forest".
- The site may have Aboriginal significance.
- It is interim listed on the Register of the National Estate and has been identified by the Department of Environment and Climate Change as site of national heritage significance.

Comment

Questions were raised by Members about the jurisdiction of the Heritage Act over Commonwealth land. The Committee recommended that the Office write to the Department of the Environment and Water Resources, copy to the Department of Defense seeking advice about the status of the land. It was also considered that a more up to date assessment was needed.

Further, the nomination should be referred to the NSW Department of Environment and Climate Change for comment. Members noted that Cumberland Plain Woodland was protected by other State legislation.

Given jurisdictional issues associated with the site – ie its being under Commonwealth ownership, Members expressed doubts about the ability to list it on the State Heritage Register.

7. Coaching Stables – Walgett LGA

- This item was nominated by Graham Hall, heritage advisor for Walgett Shire Council.
- It is an old staging post of the mid to late 19th century horse and coach service run by Nowland Bros. The item is a two story wooden stables building, not currently in use.
- The site is owned privately and is not on any heritage list. It is highly regarded by the local community.
- No date of construction is known.
- The proposed curtilage would be around the stables and include the archaeological site of Blacksmiths.

Comment

From the photograph, Members agreed that the building appeared to be in poor condition and raised doubts about its realistic longevity. Members commented that the nomination lacked information, but on balance was not likely to be of State significance and is more likely to be of local significance. Given the building's condition, the Committee recommended that it be properly recorded.

8. Coonamble Museum – former Police Station and Stables.

- This item was nominated by Graham Hall, Heritage Advisor to Coonamble Shire
- This nomination is associated with a Heritage Incentives Program application.
- It is listed as a heritage item on the LEP and on the Register of the National Estate.
- It is owned by Coonamble Shire which supports the nomination.

- The Heritage Advisor thinks it is the last mounted police stables left in NSW.
- The proposed curtilage follows the site's lot boundary.
- Movable heritage is housed in the museum.
- The Heritage Advisor contends the item is of State heritage significance because of the intactness of the stables and its relationship to the police station.

Comment

Members queried the claim that the item was in fact the last mounted police stables left in NSW, citing the stables currently in use in Sydney. It was recommended that the Police S.170 Heritage and Conservation register be checked in an attempt to confirm the actual number of stables in existence. It was also recommended that National Trust listings be checked. Members advised that the Heritage Office should view the Conversation Plan for comparative analysis.

Members were undecided on the claims of State heritage significance for the site, agreeing that more research was required.

9. Osborne Memorial (Anglican) Church of St. Luke, Dapto

- This item was nominated by a member of the Local Parish.
- It's LGA is Wollongong.
- The complex includes the original church building dated from 1840, and the current church building designed by John Horbury Hunt in 1880, and a cemetery.
- The complex is owned by the Anglican Diocese of Sydney which does not support the proposed listing.
- The site is currently listed as a heritage item by Council's LEP, by the National Trust and on the Register of the National Estate.

Comment

Members agreed that the complex is not rare, and that there are a number of Horbury Hunt church buildings in the State. Members requested the Heritage Office confirm the number of Horbury Hunt churches listed on the State Heritage Register. It was agreed that more comparative analysis was needed. Not all Horbury Hunt churches should be listed on the State Heritage Register – only the best examples. Until further comparative analysis was carried out, a decision on whether the site was of State heritage significance could not be made.

10. St. George's Anglican Church Parkes

- This item was nominated by the parish and is associated with the Heritage Incentive Program grants of 2006.
- The LGA is Parkes.
- The item consists of a church building dating from 1889 and the main church which was commenced in 1926 and completed in 1956 designed by Louis Williams in Arts & Crafts Interwar Gothic style.
- The site is owned by the Anglican Diocese of Bathurst which supports the nomination.
- It is listed on the LEP, by the National Trust and by the RAIA.
- Religious Property Advisory Panel considered the nomination at its meeting in May 2007 and resolved it was probably of State significance.

Comment

Members agreed that the primary claim for State Heritage Register listing is its architectural merit. Comment was made that all churches in this series of nominations should be referred to the Heritage Council's religious property Advisory

Panel for review. The Committee considers that the site is likely to be of local heritage significance, but would like the nomination to be reconsidered by the Religious Property Advisory Panel (RPAP)

11. St John the Baptist Anglican church and Organ, Mudgee

- This item was nominated by Barbara Hickson as member of local community
- The LGA is Mid-Western Regional Council.
- It is owned by the Anglican Church which supports the nomination.
- The item was designed by Weaver and Kemp and dates from 1858.
- Featured in the nomination is a Brindley and Forster Organ – which is rare and in working order. Also featured is a large cast steel bell and stained glass windows.
- The item is a landmark building in Mudgee.
- It is listed on the LEP as a heritage item and by the National Trust.
- Religious Property Advisory Panel considered the nomination at its meeting in May 2007 and recommended it for listing on the State Heritage Register.

Comment

It was stated that archaeology should be thoroughly considered for the site. The Committee agreed that the organ is highly significant. The Members asked the Heritage Office to arrange a meeting with the Religious Property Advisory Panel to discuss State Heritage Register nominations in general, and this nomination in particular. Also to be discussed is the need for a thematic study on religious buildings. Members agreed that the site was of potential State heritage significance, but this view could only be finalised following the proposed meeting with RPAP.

Resolved

- 1. That the Heritage Council's Religious Property Advisory Panel be invited to attend a future meeting of the State Heritage Register Committee to discuss nominations to the State Heritage Register Committee in general.**

Moved Michael Clarke
Seconded Tina Jackson

12. Cobb & Co Coach, Bathurst Regional LGA

- This item was nominated by Central West Project, by Barbara Hickson - Heritage Advisor.
- The item dates from 1860, and is a 12 seater coach, fully restored.
- It is owned by the Bathurst Regional Council which supports the nomination.
- It is one of only six known surviving Cobb & Co coaches from this period in Australia and the other one in NSW, is at the Powerhouse Museum.
- The nomination states that provenance has been established, but this information has not been included with the submission.
- The curator of the Powerhouse Museum was consulted and considers the loss of original fabric of the coach detracts from its significance. Perhaps only half of the coach is original material. The Powerhouse Museum has offered to assess the coach.

Comment

Members agreed that the Heritage Office should further liaise with the Powerhouse Museum, to assist in the assessment of the coach. Also to be sought from the Powerhouse Museum is a list of Cobb and Co coaches around the state. Members believe that a thematic study on Cobb & Co is needed to address coaches and places

associated with the coaches. To be considered is a serial listing of the six extant coaches.

13. World War 1 Collection

- This is a private collection of 100 groups of World War 1 medals.
- The medals were presented to the men of the 9th Infantry Brigade, Australian Imperial Force (33rd, 34th and 35th Battalions)
- It is known as the Harrower Collection and is reputedly largest collection of its kind.
- These Battalions have a distinct NSW connection.
- The Battalions all participated in fighting in France from 1916.
- The nominated has not provided a State Heritage Inventory form or any comparative data.
- No similar collection has come before the Heritage Office.

Comment

Members raised doubt that the collection was of State heritage significance, but recommended that the views of the Australian War Memorial be sought.

14. Morpeth Heritage Conservation Area, Morpeth

- This item was nominated by Morpeth Heritage Conservation Group
- The LGA is Maitland
- The curtilage is the whole town and its rural setting.
- Two DA's are currently before Council for Seniors Living developments.

Comment

Members agreed that the town was potentially of State heritage significance. It was however noted that a listing on such a large scale, like Braidwood, would be a significant resource commitment for the Heritage Office.

Members enquired what other towns had been nominated or were under consideration for listing on the State Heritage Register. This information was requested for consideration at the next meeting.

15. Carriers Arms

- The Carrier Arms is a single storey brick building with cement rendered walls.
- The LGA is Bourke
- The first stage of the building was completed in 1879 with its license being issued that year.
- Henry Lawson lived nearby, was a frequent customer in his summer visit to Bourke in 1892-93, and referred to the building as the "Shearer's Arms Hotel in some of his poems and short stories.
- The hotel was a staging post for Cobb and Co coaches from Hungerford to Queensland.
- Bourke held a central role of the great strikes of the 1890s and it is possible that the hotel was associated with unionism.
- There have been substantial alterations inside the building, particularly after a fire in 1984.
- The item was nominated by the owners.
- It currently used as a Church.
- The nomination was previously refused for listing by the Heritage Office. Of primary concern were the low level of intact fabric, and the ability of the fabric to demonstrate its values now.
- Subsequently, the owners have requested a reconsideration of this decision.

- They contend that the commissioned report "clearly demonstrates that the building is of State significance due to its association with Henry Lawson, Cobb & Co., and the shearers strikes of the late 1800".

Comment

The Committee agreed that the historic associations, such as those with Lawson, are not demonstrated by the fabric of the building now due to its low level of intactness. Members concluded that the former hotel is of local significance.

16. Gwawley Bay Landscape Conservation Area

- The Bay's remnant canals or "clares" are evidence of the first attempt to cultivate oysters in the Colony of NSW.
- 48 kms of clares were constructed from the 1870s
- It is said to be probably the only known attempt in Australia to cultivate oysters using the French method in Australia
- It is purported to have laid the foundations for the oyster industry in NSW.
- The site is also said to have rare species – the Narrow Leaf Hedge and Swamp Mahogany.

Comment

The Committee recommended that the nomination be referred to the Office's maritime archaeologists for further review. Members also requested that the Office confirm whether the site was listed as a heritage item on the local council's LEP. It was noted that eating oysters were a very popular in Australia in the 19th Century.

Members did however conclude that the site was not of State heritage significance.

Resolved

2. The comments of members regarding the following potential items are endorsed by the Committee:

1. St. Mary's Tower, Douglas Park
2. Cathedral Church of St Saviour Precinct, Goulburn
3. Old Pambula Rifle Range
4. Alamy Creek Reserve, Grafton
5. Port of Wentworth
6. RAAF/RAN Ammunition Depot conservation Area
7. Coaching Stables – Walgett LGA
8. Coonamble Museum – former Police Station and Stables.
9. Osborne Memorial (Anglican) Church of St. Luke, Dapto
10. St. George's Anglican Church Parkes
11. St John the Baptist Anglican church and Organ, Mudgee
12. Cobb & Co Coach, Bathurst Regional LGA
13. World War 1 Collection
14. Morpeth Heritage Conservation Area, Morpeth
15. Carriers Arms
16. Gwawley Bay Landscape Conservation Area

Moved: Robert Goodman

Seconded: Michael Clarke

8.0 SHR – Notice of Intention to List

Nil

9.0 State Heritage Register – Recommendation to Minister

Nil

10.0 State Government Heritage (Section 170 Registers/HAMS)

Nil

11.0 Interim Heritage Orders

11.1 Status Report

Members noted the status report. The Committee was advised that the Midget Submarine is due to be considered by the Heritage Council in November. The Great North Road assessment is currently being carried out. The heritage assessment had commenced on the St. Mary and St. Mina Coptic Church at Sydenham, while Snowy River Council was carrying out the heritage assessment for the Old Adaminaby Remains.

Resolved:

- 1. That the Heritage Council State Heritage Register Committee notes this status report**

Moved: Robert Goodman

Seconded: Michael Clarke

12.0 Environmental Planning Instruments & Heritage Studies

Members considered the status report.

Resolved:

- 1. That the Heritage Council State Heritage Register Committee notes this status report.**

Moved: Rosemary Annable

Seconded: Tina Jackson

13.0 Matters for Consideration

Nil

14.0 General Business

Nil

The meeting closed at 4.15 pm

Next Meeting of the Heritage Council State Heritage Register Committee

Wednesday November 7th, 2007 at 9:30 AM

Heritage Office – Department of Planning
Heritage Office Library
3 Marist Place
Parramatta

Minutes endorsed by the Heritage Council State Heritage Register Committee.	<hr/> Chair, State Heritage Register Committee Date:
--	---