

MINUTES OF MEETING

State Heritage Register Committee

Wednesday April 4, 2007
Commencing at 1.30 pm

Heritage Office – Department of Planning
Heritage Office Library
3 Marist Place
Parramatta



1.0 Attendance

PRESENT	Jason Ardler Michael Clarke Reece McDougall Rosemary Annable Tina Jackson
APOLOGIES	Sharon Sullivan John Robertson Hewitt Whyman Professor Ross Fitzgerald
ALSO IN ATTENDANCE (NSW Heritage Office)	Cameron White Bruce Baskerville Perpetual Fernandes Tim Smith Bronwyn Hanna Anthony Mitchell

Opening – Welcome

The Chair opened the meeting at 1.30 pm

2.0 Declarations of Interest

Nil

3.0 Confirmation of Minutes

The minutes of the previous meeting held March 7th, 2007 were noted and adopted by the Committee.

Moved	Michael Clarke
Seconded	Reece McDougall

4.0 Action Report

Members enquired about item 12.1 National Heritage Listing, and were informed by the Heritage Office that comments from the members were being sought.

Members inquired about the progress of the State Heritage listing for Macquarie Place, Sydney. Members were advised that the listing was being considered by the Minister.

The Queen Victoria was raised by Members as to its current status. Members were advised that Sydney Council owned the building and the Lord Mayor had objected to the listing. The listing would be revisited and a meeting held with Council staff in an attempt to resolve any concerns.

With regard to Morella, Cameron White informed the Committee that no progress had been made by the Office in trying to make contact with the owner, despite several attempts. Despite being strongly supportive of the values of the house, the owner had not carried out much needed repairs and would not make contact with the Heritage Office to discuss the proposed listing on the State Heritage Register. Members were advised that Mosman Council was concerned at the state of dilapidation of the house and was contemplating issuing a demolition order. Members requested the Office to continue to attempt to make contact with the owner.

Cameron White also informed Members that the Minister has given approval for the State Heritage Register of Nora Head Light House.

Reece McDougal informed the Committee that a request for an Interim Heritage Order had been received for Fairview Mangrove Creek, Gosford. The Heritage Office has sent a letter to the Gosford Council seeking deferral to the building's demolition while an assessment of significance is carried out by Council.

5.0 Minutes, reports and matters arising from HC Advisory Panels

Nil

6.0 Presentations

6.1 Sydney University Heritage Management

A presentation was made by Chris Legge - Wilkinson from Sydney University on its heritage management processes.

The University has adopted a proactive approach to heritage management of its large heritage portfolio. Highlights include:

- a unit in the University dealing with heritage assets;
- building restoration program;
- Section 170 Heritage and Conservation Register;
- Heritage Asset Management Strategy; and
- Conservation Management Plans.

Mr Legge - Wilkinson went on to highlight a number of aspects of the program.

Anderson Stuart Building

The project involved conservation work to the façade and a new entrance terrace to improve access. Conservation works were the replacement of the existing slate roof with new slate from Canada. The cleaning and repointing of existing stonework also took place as did the replacement of stonework.

Conservation management plans

The University had demonstrated leadership in the preparation of Conservation Management Plans. Plans have been developed for :

- John Woolley Building
- Science Road Cottage
- Round house
- R.C. Mills Building
- R.D. Watt Building
- Old Teachers' College

The Committee thanked Mr. Legge – Wilkinson's for his informative presentation.

7.0 State Heritage Register – Notice of Intention to List

7.1 Sodwall's Inn

Bronwyn Hanna spoke to this matter. Sodwalls Inn and cemetery is located about 20 km west of Lithgow, within the Lithgow LGA. The inn dates from 1856 and is not made of sod but of random rubble construction with stone quoining. The cemetery contains burials from around 1870 when the camp for workers building the western railway, which was situated across the road from the inn, experienced a diphtheria epidemic. The owner supports the nomination.

Sodwalls Inn and cemetery is considered by the Heritage Office to be of State significance under criteria c – its aesthetic value - as an intact and representative example of a colonial-era vernacular village inn, with small indirectly related cemetery. It is in its original rural setting and is a focal point of that landscape. It has been carefully conserved by its current owners over some years.

The Heritage Office has been in discussion with owner resulting in the proposed curtilage of two precincts within the original 40 hectare grant from 1829. These are a large precinct of about 6-7 hectares enclosing the inn and bounded by the main road and the eastern boundary which includes an 1890s barn, and a second precinct of about half a hectare enclosing the cemetery on the top of a hill behind the inn, adjoining the western boundary. The owner wished to exclude land west of the inn on the main road, as it is out of sight of the inn and may be considered suitable for rural subdivision in the future. The land to the rear of the inn was not considered relevant to the listing.

There are no known Aboriginal heritage issues in relation to the property. A submission on the property will be sent to the next AHAP meeting on 10 May.

There are no known contentious issues with this nomination.

Members questioned whether the property was of State heritage significance. The cemetery for example was not considered to meet this threshold, given the relative common nature of railway gangs across the State. Likewise questions were raised about whether the house reached the necessary threshold for listing on the State Heritage Register. Members agreed that further research was required into its heritage significance.

Resolved:

That the State Heritage Register Committee:

- 1. acknowledges the heritage significance of Sodwall's Inn to the local area and region;**
- 2. defers consideration of the nomination;**
- 3. directs the Heritage Office to confirm eligibility for funding assistance for the owner of the property for the preparation of a conservation management plan;**
- 4. directs the Heritage Office to encourage the owner to carry out further investigations into the heritage significance of the site as part of a conservation management plan, supported by part grant funding from the Heritage Office, if available;**
- 5. requests the Heritage Office to carry out a survey of pre 1850 cottages on a State-wide basis to provide comparative data to assist in establishing heritage significance; and**
- 6. requests the Heritage Office to report back to the Committee on these matters.**

Moved: Rosemary Annable

Seconded: Michael Clarke

7.2 Minnamurra House (Kiama LGA)

Anthony spoke to this matter. The Heritage Office is seeking direction from the Committee as to whether the house is of State heritage significance.

In summary the Heritage Office considers:

- It represents a fine example of a late Colonial Georgian homestead;
- The house has an important movable heritage collection; and
- The nominated area covers some 28.5 hectares and forms a highly intact cultural landscape set within a much broader visual catchment.

It has been nominated by the current owners. The nomination seeks to establish State significance on the basis of historical significance (criteria a); aesthetic significance (criteria c); and technical research significance (criteria e).

The Committee enquired if there was a local heritage study available that establishes the relative heritage significance of the property.

Overall, the Committee agreed with the importance of the house to the Illawarra Region, but questioned whether it reached the State heritage significance threshold. Members agreed that further research was required into its heritage significance.

Resolved:

That the State Heritage Register Committee:

- 1. acknowledges the heritage significance of Minnamurra House to the local area and Illawarra region;**
- 2. defers consideration of the nomination;**
- 3. directs the Heritage Office to confirm eligibility for funding assistance for the owner of the property for the preparation of a conservation management plan;**
- 4. directs the Heritage Office to encourage the owner to carry out further investigations into the heritage significance of the site as part of a conservation management plan, supported by part grant funding from the Heritage Office, if available;**
- 5. requests the Heritage Office to carry out a survey of pre 1850 cottages on a State-wide basis to provide comparative data to assist in establishing heritage significance; and**
- 6. requests the Heritage Office to report back to the Committee on these matters.**

Moved: Rosemary Annable

Seconded: Jason Ardler

8.0 State Heritage Register – Recommendation to Minister

8.1 Holy Trinity Anglican Church Group Kelso

Bronwyn Hanna spoke to this matter. She informed the Committee that the Heritage Office received an email (the day before the meeting) from the Anglican Property Trust, Diocese of Bathurst - the owner of the item. The email, which was tabled for the information of Members, requests that the consideration of the listing of the church be deferred until the Trust has more time to discuss the proposed listing with the Kelso Anglican Parish. The parish had previously sent the Heritage Office a letter saying that it supported the listing. The Heritage Office had also contacted the parish on the 16th March 2007 to notify it that this listing report was being prepared and the parish did not then raise any objections to the listing.

The Committee agreed that the item should be deferred to allow for further discussions between the Trust, the Parish and the Heritage Office.

Resolved:

That the State Heritage Register Committee:

- 1. notes the issues raised by the Anglican Property Trust, Diocese of Bathurst; and**
- 2. defers consideration of the proposed listing of the Holy Trinity Anglican Church Group Kelso to allow for further negotiations between Kelso Anglican Parish, the Anglican Property Trust, Diocese of Bathurst and the Heritage Office.**

Moved: Reece McDougall
Seconded: Jason Ardler

8.2 Binnawee Homestead and Outbuildings Mudgee

Binnawee Homestead and Outbuildings is a historic farm dating from the 1850s and located about 10 km north-west of Mudgee, within the Mid Western Regional LGA. It was nominated by the president of the local historical society and the owner.

Binnawee is considered to be of State significance under 5 heritage criteria: historical themes (farming); aesthetics (as an intact Georgian two storey homestead), and for its research, rarity and representative values.

The proposed curtilage was developed in collaboration with the owners and the nominator, to include the elements of State significance. These are the homestead, outbuildings and view towards the creek, but exclude elements that are not considered significant, such as the 1950s house where the family currently lives.

The Aboriginal Heritage Advisory Panel has discussed the nomination and stated support, subject to the normal process of community consultation.

It is noted that since the homestead has not been occupied since 1970 and the kitchen wing has been seriously damaged by a storm. In view of this, Heritage Office staff made a site visit on the 29th August 2006 and assessed the condition of the buildings. The Office is of the view that the buildings would meet Minimum Standards of Maintenance & Repair except the kitchen wing. The Heritage Office has advised the family of the maintenance requirements under the Heritage Act and the family has indicated that they still support the nomination. The Heritage Office proposes that the kitchen wing be managed as a ruin, in accordance with the policy statement on ruins.

Overall, Members agreed the site was of State heritage significance.

Resolved:

That the State Heritage Register Committee:

- 1. in accordance with section 33 (1)(d) of the Heritage Act, 1977 advises the Minister that the item known as "Binnawee Historic Homestead and Outbuildings" at 111 Lester's Lane Mudgee, is of State heritage significance, as shown in the plan at Annexure B;**
- 2. recommends to the Minister, in accordance with sections 32(1) and (2) of the Heritage Act, that the Minister directs the listing of the item, "Binnawee Historic Homestead and Outbuildings" at 111 Lester's Lane Mudgee, on the State Heritage Register if the Minister considers the item is of State heritage significance;**
- 3. in accordance with sections 33 (1)(e) of the Heritage Act 1977, gives notice of its decision to persons notified under section 33(1)(a);**
- 4. the damaged kitchen building is considered to be a ruin, will be managed as a ruin, and is not subject to the Minimum Standards of Maintenance and Repair (outlined in the *Heritage Act 1977* and Regulation);**

5. in accordance with section 57(2) of the Heritage Act, recommend the Minister grant the following exemption/s from section 57(1) in addition to the Heritage Council Standard Exemptions:
- i) All Standard Exemptions
 - ii) Maintenance, cleaning and repairs of existing fabric and structures, where such activities are in accordance with the conservation policies of the Conservation Management Policy and the Standard Exemptions.
 - iii) Activities associated with the ongoing use of the land for pastoral and agricultural purposes in which buildings, structures and lands are used for their traditional purposes. This excludes any new development that may materially affect the significance of the item.
 - iv) All activities for gardening of existing garden beds where these activities do not impact on or damage existing built structures, such as retaining walls and fences, do not damage trees planted before 1940, and are in accordance with the conservation policies of the Conservation Management Policy.
 - v) All activities for maintenance, installation and alterations to building electrical and lighting services where such activities are sympathetic to and minimise alterations to heritage fabric and spaces, and are in accordance with the conservation policies of the Conservation Management Policy.
 - vi) All activities for maintenance and alterations to the stormwater disposal system, such as guttering and downpipes, where such activities do not damage, are sympathetic to and minimise alterations to heritage fabric and spaces, and are in accordance with the conservation policies of the Conservation Management Policy.
 - vii) Structural reinforcement of existing building fabric where these activities are sympathetic to and minimise alterations to heritage fabric and spaces, and are in accordance with the conservation policies of the Conservation Management Policy.
 - viii) All works to moveable items and contents where this will not have an effect on the material significance of the place.

Moved: Reece McDougall
Seconded: Rosemary Annabel

9.0 State Government Heritage (Section 170 Registers/HAMS)

9.1 Heritage Asset Management Strategies (HAMS) - Treasury – Crown Property Portfolio & Department of Commerce

Tim Smith introduced this matter. Tim Smith gave the Committee background on HAMS and on recent initiatives by the Heritage Office to assist agencies to prepare the documents. For this State Heritage Register Committee meeting there are two HAMS presented to the Committee for its consideration. These are the NSW Department of Commerce and Treasury Crown Properties Portfolio.

Anthony Mitchell, who had assessed the documents, gave the Members a more detailed explanation of their content. The HAMS could be endorsed subject to minor editorial matters being addressed to the satisfaction of the Executive Director of the Heritage Office. These matters are outlined in the recommendations.

Resolved:

That the State Heritage Register Committee:

1. accepts the two (2) tabled HAMS documents submitted by the Department of Commerce and NSW Treasury - Crown Properties Portfolio, in accordance with the State Owned Heritage Management Principles and Heritage Asset Management Guidelines, issued under Section 170A(3) of the Heritage Act, 1977;
2. directs the Executive Director, Heritage Office, Department of Planning, to write to those agencies advising of same, and noting identified editorial comments for inclusion in a future review document, to the satisfaction of the Executive Director:
 - NSW Department of Commerce
 - i) revises the document to update the proposed start and completion times for key heritage tasks;
 - ii) makes editorial corrections to confirm the integration of heritage management issues (eg; redundant asset management/asset transfer processes /etc) into key in-house policy documents;
 - iii) includes the addition of examples of the broad range of heritage assets managed by the agency including photographs.
 - Treasury Crown Properties Portfolio
 - i) revises the document to update the proposed start and completion times for key heritage tasks;
 - ii) makes editorial corrections to confirm the integration of heritage management issues (eg; redundant asset management/asset transfer processes /etc) into key in-house policy documents;
 - iii) includes confirmation of the agency's Section 170 Register submission date using the mandatory SHI software platform.
3. congratulates these agencies for their HAMS submission

Moved: Michael Clarke
Seconded: Reece McDougal

10.0 Interim Heritage Orders

10.1 Status Report

Cameron White spoke to this matter. He advised that there were two Interim Heritage Orders made by the Minister currently in force:

- M24 Japanese Midget Submarine wreck site and
- Great North Road, Bucketty

It was confirmed that the significance of both items will be assessed.

11.0 Environmental Planning Instruments & Heritage Studies

11.1 Status Report

Alice Brandjes spoke to this matter. Alice Brandjes commenced by providing the Committee information about the Department's LEP Review Panel which is responsible for reviewing LEPs and providing advice to Councils and the Department. She informed the Committee that in 11 months the LEP Review Panel has considered 423 LEPs, 324 - 80% which were supported to proceed. Members enquired what occurred if the Panel objected to an LEP. Alice Brandjes informed Members that if such a case occurred, further discussions will occur with the Panel and stakeholders.

In terms of LEPs considered by the Heritage Office, eight draft LEPs were considered in the period 17 February 2007 to 22 March 2007 related to "housekeeping" amendments, spot rezonings and comprehensive new instruments. The Heritage Office also assessed two development control plans in the period.

Members considered the report.

Resolved

That the State Heritage Register Committee:

1. Notes this status report.

12.0 Matters for Consideration

NIL

13.0 General Business

Members discussed with Heritage Office staff the assessment of State Heritage Register nominations, the process of report preparation and the content of agendas. It was acknowledged that report preparation was a labour intensive process. Members also discussed the desire of ensuring the quality of nominations and the integrity of the State Heritage Register. Members wish to canvas options to address these matters, having regard to available Heritage Office resources and agreed to that a workshop be held next meeting in place of normal nominations assessments.

Resolved

That the State Heritage Register Committee:

1. requests the Heritage Office to prepare a discussion paper canvassing options for the preparation of nominations for the Committee's consideration, ensuring the quality of nominations and the integrity of the State Heritage Register; and

2. agrees to devote the next meeting of the Committee to the discussion of this matter.

The meeting closed at 4 pm

Next Meeting of the Heritage Council State Heritage Register Committee

Wednesday May 2nd 2007 at 9.30AM

Heritage Office – Department of Planning
Heritage Office Library
3 Marist Place
Parramatta

Minutes endorsed by the Heritage Council State Heritage Register Committee.	<hr/> Chair, State Heritage Register Committee Date:
---	---