

MINUTES OF THE HERITAGE COUNCIL APPROVALS COMMITTEE
Wednesday 2 July 2003 at the Heritage Office, 3 Marist Place,
Parramatta at 9:30am

Attendance

Garry Fielding	Chair
Diane Jones	
Susan Macdonald	Assistant Director, Heritage Office
Bruce Pettman	Deputy, Department of Commerce
Rod Leaver	
Elsa Atkin	National Trust

Also in Attendance

Lannie Purcell	Heritage Office
Vincent Sicari	Heritage Office
Stuart Read	Heritage Office (Item 9.1)
Rajeev Maini	Heritage Office (Item 5.1)
John Rustamzadeh	Rail Link (Item 4.1)
Martin Halliday	Rail Link (Item 4.1)
Rebecca Eddington	Rail Link (Item 4.1)
Kate Cox	Rail Link (Item 4.1)
Richard Mackay	Godden Mackay Logan (Item 4.1)
Anne Mackay	Godden Mackay Logan (Item 4.1)
Janine Smith	Godden Mackay Logan (Item 4.1)
Ian Stapleton	Heritage Office consultant (Item 4.1)

1.1 Declarations of Interest

Diane Jones – Item 5.1 Customs House, 31 Alfred Street, Sydney

1.2 Apologies

Mary-Lynne Taylor
Terry Barnes

3. Confirmation of the minutes of the previous meetings

The minutes of the meeting of 4 June 2003 were confirmed.

3. Action Report

Members noted the Action Report for 4 June 2003.

4. Presentations

4.1 Parramatta Rail Link update – interchanges at Parramatta and Chatswood, proposal for Epping Station

Representatives of Rail Link and Godden Mackay Logan attended the meeting to present an update on proposed changes to proposals for Parramatta and Chatswood Transport Interchanges. The presentation covered issues relating to design, heritage and planning approval. The schemes for both stations now propose changes to the earlier proposals commented upon by the Heritage Council and approved by the Minister.

MINUTES OF THE HERITAGE COUNCIL APPROVALS COMMITTEE
Wednesday 2 July 2003 at the Heritage Office, 3 Marist Place,
Parramatta at 9:30am

Chatswood Station

The current scheme now involves demolition of the station buildings and platforms, including the three identified heritage items, to allow raising the track level and changes to platform configuration.

Various archaeological features have been identified in the vicinity, but their retention in situ will not be possible. The Heritage Council will have an approval role in determining S140 applications for the work.

Mitigation measures to be implemented included development of an interpretation strategy in consultation with stakeholders, photographic and archival recording and archaeological monitoring.

Parramatta Station

The current scheme proposes demolition of and excavation of the Argyle Street block, lowering the level of Argyle Street by about 2 metres. The works will also require partial demolition of historic subway tunnels to provide escalator access and demolition of existing subway tunnels.

Mitigation measures included preparation of a heritage impact assessment by Austral Archaeology, photographic archival recording, archaeological investigation and permits and development of an interpretation strategy.

Members were informed that for Chatswood the proposed timing is that subject to planning approval, tenders are to be let in March 2004, with completion in late 2007. For Parramatta, planning approval is anticipated in November/December this year, contracts to be let by January 2004, and completion by late 2006.

Mr Rustamzadeh stressed that Parramatta Rail Link was seeking an in-principle agreement to the proposals at this stage.

5. Integrated Development Applications/Section 60 and 132 Applications/Section 140 Excavation Permits

5.1 Customs House, 31 Alfred Street, Sydney – S96 amendment

Members considered a report on an application to modify previous consent for alterations to the Customs House. The new proposals involve redesign of the outdoor seating area in the forecourt, replacing the existing ground floor escalator with a curved stair, design changes to all levels, including expansion of the bridge links adjacent to the southern façade, incorporation of a graphic screen in the atrium and removal of the glazed wall to the fire stair and placement of the city model into a sub-floor recessed display case. Rajeev Maini informed members that most of the modifications are acceptable in heritage terms. However, because archaeological information has not been provided, excavation for the city model needs more consideration.

Members expressed concern at the potential loss of a valuable resource by siting the city model below ground by removing the ability for it to be seen as a three dimensional model.

MINUTES OF THE HERITAGE COUNCIL APPROVALS COMMITTEE
Wednesday 2 July 2003 at the Heritage Office, 3 Marist Place,
Parramatta at 9:30am

Resolved:

- 1) That the Heritage Council approve the application with the following conditions in addition to the ones placed on the original Development Approval:
 - a) all work must be carried out under the supervision of an experienced heritage consultant;
 - b) rostrums in the Barnet long room should be constructed out of timber and fixed to the room in a reversible manner causing the least amount of impact as possible.
 - c) Proposed installation of the city model is deferred pending the results of the archaeological assessment. A separate S60 application is required to be submitted to the Heritage Council for this work. This application must include a Heritage impact assessment including an archaeological assessment and an assessment of potential impact on the archaeological resource. This assessment should be prepared in accordance with the Archaeological Assessment Guidelines by Heritage Office & DUAP;

- 2) It is noted that the model below ground reduces the ability to view it to an aerial view only. This limits the ability of the model to perform as a three dimensional tool for planners and public. Although this is not a heritage issue it would appear to be a lost opportunity and a limitation on this wonderful resource. Part of the intent of moving the model was to provide an impetus to enter and engage with the building – now that its interior has been made visible through the conversion of the ground floor windows to doors. If the model is not visible this will not achieve this aim.

- 3) It is also noted that as conditions relating to previous conditions of consent required interpretation, these interpretation elements should be incorporated into current works.

6. Development Application Referrals

6.1 Mount St Mary's College and Convent (Renaissance Centre) 10-14 Civic Place, Katoomba

Members considered a further report on a development application for the Mount St Mary's Convent site. Members noted comments by the Heritage Council working party which inspected the site on 26 May. They also noted that the current scheme has been amended in response to those comments.

Members expressed continuing concern with the massing and bulk of the proposed link between the convent building and the new building to the west. Members considered that the aim of achieving a light-weight link has not been achieved. It was also agreed that the new building should be pulled further back.

Members agreed that any approval for the development should ensure that the conservation works are carried out in conjunction with the new construction. It was proposed that this be achieved by incorporating a staged approval mechanism into the approval process.

To assist with conservation works to the garden, it was proposed to request Blue Mountains City Council to waive the S.94 contribution on condition that it be used for the garden.

MINUTES OF THE HERITAGE COUNCIL APPROVALS COMMITTEE
Wednesday 2 July 2003 at the Heritage Office, 3 Marist Place,
Parramatta at 9:30am

Members discussed the cost of proposed works to the former science block and agreed that it would be preferable that the block be demolished. If not demolished, there should be no changes to its existing envelope.

Members agreed that a meeting with the applicants should be arranged to discuss the above issues.

Resolved:

that the Heritage Council Approvals Committee as delegate of the Heritage Council:

- 1. acknowledges the benefits of a commercial development that will help contribute to the conservation of the existing buildings and associated landscape as well as allowing continued public access to the site and notes:**
 - a. a Conservation Management Plan has been submitted and assessed by the Heritage Office. Modifications have been requested and carried out and it is proposed to recommend endorsement;**
 - b. that the applicant has provided financial information about the proposal to explain the level of new development proposed;**
 - c. that after the site visit of 26 May 2003, the Heritage Office forwarded comments from the Heritage Council Working Party to the applicant for their consideration and a request to modify their proposal;**
 - d. the applicant has submitted a modified proposal that takes into consideration the comments provided by the Heritage Council working party;**
- 2. writes to Blue Mountains City Council and inform them that the Heritage Council supports the works proposed in Development Application No. X/1963/2002, but in a modified form subject to conditions as follows:**
 - a. this consent is not to operate until the applicant satisfies the Council and the Director of the Heritage Office that the staging plan for the proposed development and the conservation works is acceptable.**
 - b. The eastern face of the new western building (building 7) shall be set back to the line of the proposed pitched roof.**
 - c. the intrusive former science block (building 11) shall be demolished to enhance views to and from the existing heritage building and to increase the curtilage around it.**
 - d. All work should generally be carried out in accordance with the documents listed below:**
 - i) A3 Drawings prepared by Urbanistica marked Job No. 215, Drawing nos.; DA-01 (B), DA-02 (C), DA-03 (C), DA-04 (C), DA-05 (C), DA-06 (C), DA-07 (C), DA-08 (C), DA-09 (B), DA-10 (B), DA-11 (B), DA-12 (B), DA-13 (B), DA-14 (B), DA-15 (C), DA-18 (B), DA-19 (B), DA-20 (B), subject to modifications as shown Sketches 1 to 7 inclusive, dated 10/06/03 except as amended to provide for a lighter link between the heritage building and the new building to its west.;**
 - ii) the Conservation and Management Plan prepared by Graham Brooks and Associates, endorsed by the Heritage Council;**
 - e. Documentation for significant items (built and landscape) in the southern heritage precinct shall be submitted to the satisfaction of the Director Heritage Office in consultation with the HC working party. This documentation should provide for a lighter and lower link that provides a far greater degree of visual separation between the old and the new building to the west. This work shall be prepared in consultation with an**

MINUTES OF THE HERITAGE COUNCIL APPROVALS COMMITTEE
Wednesday 2 July 2003 at the Heritage Office, 3 Marist Place,
Parramatta at 9:30am

architect with experience in the conservation of heritage similar heritage items.

- f. The site works for the southern heritage precinct shall be supervised by an architect with experience in the conservation of similar heritage items.
 - g. The approval shall be void if the activity to which it refers is not physically commenced within five years after the date of the approval or within the period of consent specified in any development consent granted under the Environmental Planning and Assessment Act, 1979.
 - h. An interpretation strategy shall be prepared for the building and submitted for the approval of the Heritage Council of NSW. Following approval, the interpretation plan shall be implemented as part of the construction works program.
 - i. A heritage consultant shall be nominated to advise on design resolution and on conformity to the conservation management documents. The name and experience of this consultant shall be submitted to the Heritage Council of NSW for approval.
 - j. The nominated heritage consultant shall provide written confirmation to the Heritage Council of NSW that the detailed design is in conformity with the conservation management documents and all statutory approvals prior to construction commencing.
 - k. The nominated heritage consultant shall provide written confirmation to the Heritage Council of NSW that the works are in conformity with the conservation management documents and all statutory approvals prior to occupation.
3. recommends that any future works carried out generally in accordance with DA No. X/1963/2002 should be made exempt under 57(2), if the property is listed on the State Heritage Register.
4. recommends that Council waive the S.94 contributions and that the amount be used to restore the garden area.

7. Planning Instruments/Heritage Studies

Nil

8. Matters for Consideration

Nil

9. Matters for Information

9.1 Parramatta Rail Link update

Members discussed matters raised in the earlier presentation and considered a report on amended proposals for Parramatta and Chatswood transport interchanges.

Ian Stapleton, the Heritage Office's consultant for the project discussed with members some of the issues involved with the amended proposals.

MINUTES OF THE HERITAGE COUNCIL APPROVALS COMMITTEE
Wednesday 2 July 2003 at the Heritage Office, 3 Marist Place,
Parramatta at 9:30am

Chatswood

- In broad terms the scheme appears to be a good urban design solution for the Chatswood Station precinct.
- The impact of the proposal on Remembrance Park is not entirely clear at this stage.
- The proposed level changes at the bus station will impact on the Chatswood Hotel, an heritage item of regional significance
- The significance of Chatswood Station has been assessed. It is one of 5 remaining stations of the type. Another is Epping Station which is also proposed for demolition at this stage. It is also part of an intact group of north shore line stations to Hornsby.
- Any interpretation of the station should be of the group, not just of Chatswood Station.
- Discussion about fixtures, equipment and moveable items concluded that they should be retained and significant items prominently displayed in the new development.
- The possibility exists to link the interpretation with S140 application conditions.
- The community should be included in the process, perhaps through a celebration ceremony for the station if it is to be demolished. This would also help to reinforce the value of the other north shore stations.

Parramatta

- The complexity of the issues appear to have pushed heritage to the back of the agenda. The importance of the heritage at Parramatta should have formed one of the parameters for the design.
- The Conservation Management Plan was received only last week. The scheme will need to be tested against the CMP to ensure that heritage significance has guided detailed design.
- It appears that the proposed lowering of the level of Argyle Street will isolate the portico of the 1859 building. The opportunity exists for the 1959 portico to be reused as a station entrance. The draft CMP does say that the setting of the building should be maintained and that it be reused as an entrance. This also applies to the 1942 building on the Darcy Street side.
- There are plans to make changes to the interiors of the buildings. The CMP does not address the significance of the interiors of the station buildings in any detail.
- A proposed bus ramp passes beside the State significant Commercial Hotel and may have a significant impact on the operation of the hotel.
- At least one building of the Argyle Street properties has been identified as possibly being pre-1870s. More information is being sought on the site history pre-1874. It was considered that given their age, measured drawings should form part of the recording of this building.

Resolved:

That the Heritage Council:

- 1. notes and thanks Parramatta Rail Link Corporation for the presentation;**
- 2. notes that the draft Conservation Management Plan for Parramatta Station Group was received on 13 June 2003;**
- 3. advises that in the absence of any detailed information prior to the presentation it is difficult to provide more than preliminary comments;**

MINUTES OF THE HERITAGE COUNCIL APPROVALS COMMITTEE
Wednesday 2 July 2003 at the Heritage Office, 3 Marist Place,
Parramatta at 9:30am

4. notes that it will have an opportunity for detailed comment both on the referral from Planning NSW of an application for an amended planning approval, and in a separate section 60 and excavation permit applications required for Chatswood & Parramatta works;
5. considers in relation to the proposal for Parramatta Station and interchange that:
 - a. the existing streetside (1859 and 1942) station entry buildings should be integrated elements in the upgraded station and be restored to use as station entries;
 - b. the proposed level changes adjacent to the 1859 station building and Commercial Hotel will adversely impact on their environment, public access, use and appreciation of these heritage items;
 - c. the apparent clash between the proposed concourse escalator entry and the 1942 station building should be avoided;
 - d. the Heritage Office should provide as a matter of urgency a full briefing report on both the draft conservation management plan and the proposed scheme for Parramatta;
 - e. the conservation management plan needs to be fully reviewed so as to inform further design development;
6. notes in relation to the proposal for Chatswood station and interchange that the revised plans now involve demolition of the all station buildings and considers that the following matters are important to inform any approval of this proposal:
 - a) further detailed information on the proposed changes to Remembrance Park, adjacent to Chatswood Hotel and to the Conservation Area to the south of Albert Street are requested;
 - b) a list of fixtures, equipment and moveable heritage items and a ranking of their significance and potential for interpretation should be provided;
 - c) any physical elements (eg: signalling equipment) proposed for re-use as interpretative devices should be prominently located within the public area of the station;
 - d) interpretation should encompass the whole North Shore Line and include but not be confined to:
 - i. the place of Chatswood Station within the North Shore Line;
 - ii. community involvement in decommissioning the station if it is to be demolished;
 - iii. mechanisms for periodic updating of interpretation.

10. General Business

Cultural Landscapes

Members were informed that the Heritage Office has been tasked to look at cultural landscapes. An expert workshop will be held in August to look at strategies, identification and mechanisms for long term planning.

The Heritage Office has contacted representative local councils and experts in the field. Interested members of the Heritage Council were invited to attend.

Lidcombe Hospital

Members were informed that the proposed development of the Lidcombe Hospital site has been approved by Council, but with many conditions, one of which is that the heritage precinct is not to be used as a school. The matter is before the Land and Environment Court, which has subpoenaed Heritage Office files.

MINUTES OF THE HERITAGE COUNCIL APPROVALS COMMITTEE
Wednesday 2 July 2003 at the Heritage Office, 3 Marist Place,
Parramatta at 9:30am

11. Next Meeting

The Chair closed the meeting at 12.50pm. The next meeting is scheduled for 6 August 2003.

Signed:

Date