

MINUTES OF THE HERITAGE COUNCIL APPROVALS COMMITTEE
Wednesday 4 February 2004 at the Heritage Office, 3 Marist Place,
Parramatta at 1.30pm

Attendance

Mary-Lynne Taylor	Chair
Diane Jones	
Susan Macdonald	Assistant Director, Heritage Office
Bruce Pettman	Deputy
Rod Leaver	
Megan Jones	
Elsa Atkin	National Trust

Also in Attendance

Vincent Sicari	Heritage Office
Vanessa Williams	Heritage Office
Murat Gul	Heritage Office
Lucy Burke-Smith	Heritage Office
Ed Beebe	Heritage Office
Barry Owens	CEO IPOH Management
Ken Woolley	Ancher Martlock Woolley
Dale Swan	Ancher Martlock Woolley
Stephen Kim	Ancher Martlock Woolley
Bruce Edgar	Graham Brooks and Associates
Lewis Gross	State Rail
Lester Munro	State Rail
Garry Bayman	State Rail
Janine Kitson	Gordon Resident
Zeny Edwards	Gordon Resident
Jennifer Harvey	Gordon Resident

1. Declarations of Interest

1.2 Apologies

Sharon Sullivan
Gary Fielding

2. Confirmation of the minutes of the previous meeting

The minutes of 3 December 2003 and 14 January 2004 were confirmed.

3. Action Report

Members noted the Action Report for 3 December 2003.

4. Presentations

4.1 Queen Victoria Building – DAR

CEO of IPOH Management Barry Owens attended the Approvals Committee Meeting with his team to present their Masterplan Application for Upgrade Works to the Queen Victoria Building. Mr Owens gave background information about the future vision of the Queen Victoria Building as a Premiere shopping destination including present deficiencies in terms of upper floor patronage.

MINUTES OF THE HERITAGE COUNCIL APPROVALS COMMITTEE
Wednesday 4 February 2004 at the Heritage Office, 3 Marist Place,
Parramatta at 1.30pm

Mr Ken Woolley talked the committee through a detailed Power Point Presentation and a Fly through digital animation illustrating the construction of escalators, the use of original styles, ideas and colour schemes to enhance the QVB's attractiveness in realising its vision as a Premiere Shopping Destination.

Dale Swan and Stephen Kim were on hand to answer any technical questions posed by the Committee.

4.2 Gordon Railway Station

Janine Kitson, resident of Gordon presented to the Committee her arguments against the application in terms of it having Adverse Heritage Impacts. Janine expressed concern over the loss of an original railway station, both visually and through the loss of original fabric. Janine Kitson and her team are not against an 'Easy Access Upgrade' but to the destruction of the said Heritage Items that they perceive will occur in implementing the proposed application

State Rail Representatives presented a Power Point Presentation to show the proposed visual impacts that an 'Easy Access Upgrade' will have on Gordon Railway Station. Garry Bayman talked the Committee through some issues raised in relation to the Heritage buildings and answered queries about relocating the lifts to another position within the station. State Rail conceded that other options were not thoroughly looked at but those that were, were not viable.

5. Integrated Development Applications/Section 60 and 132 Applications/Section 140 Excavation permits

5.1 Trades Hall – Refurbishment Works – IDA.

The Sydney Trades Hall is important as one of the first and continuing headquarters of much of the New South Wales Trade Union Movement. The Approvals Committee considered an Integrated Development Application from the Sydney City Council. The applicant is proposing to carry out some demolitions, alterations and additions to the Sydney Trades Hall to upgrade the building to a B grade contemporary office building

Resolved

That the Heritage Council approve the application with the following conditions:

- 1. All work shall be in accordance with the recommendations contained within the Draft Conservation Management Plan prepared by Otto Cserhalmi & Partners dated June August 2003; the Heritage Impact Statement (contained within the Statement of Environmental Effects Revision C prepared by GSA Pty Ltd dated 11 September 2003) prepared by Otto Cserhalmi & Partners dated September 2003 and Drawings DA 001, DA 1001 to 1003, DA 1102 to 1103, DA 2001 to 2006, DA 2301 and 2302, DA 3001 and 3002, DA 3101 and DA 3102 prepared by GSA Architects dated 31 July 2003;**

except AS AMENDED by the conditions of this consent.

- 2. A qualified heritage consultant shall be employed to supervise the construction works and to advise on design resolution and conformity to the conservation management documents. The name and experience of this consultant shall be submitted to and approved by the Heritage Office prior to issue of a Construction Certificate.**

MINUTES OF THE HERITAGE COUNCIL APPROVALS COMMITTEE
Wednesday 4 February 2004 at the Heritage Office, 3 Marist Place,
Parramatta at 1.30pm

3. The nominated heritage consultant shall provide a written confirmation that the works have been carried out in conformity to the conditions of this consent and documents specified in Condition 1 prior to issue of an Occupation Certificate.
 4. Work shall be carried out by suitably qualified tradesmen with practical experience in conservation and restoration of similar heritage items.
 5. An interpretation strategy and plan shall be prepared for the buildings in conjunction with documentation, and submitted for the approval of the Director of the Heritage Office with the Section 60 application. The approved interpretation plan shall be implemented as part of the construction works program prior to issue of an Occupation Certificate.
 6. The library shall be retained in its current configuration including its shelving cabinets, books, archival materials, maps plans and other documentation.
 7. The hand painted signage including the directory boards, signs for individual union tenants and union logos throughout the Trades Hall shall be retained in situ. As part of the proposed interpretation strategy (refer to condition 5) necessary interpretative plaques shall be installed for such heritage signage.
 8. Prior to issue of a Construction Certificate a detailed archival recording (including the measured drawings and photographic recording) shall be prepared. The archival record shall be prepared in accordance with Heritage Council guidelines and copies lodged with the NSW Heritage Office, the local Council's library and the NSW State Library.
 9. Prior to issue of a Construction Certificate a detailed recording and cataloguing of the moveable heritage items shall be prepared and copies of the prepared catalogues shall be submitted to the NSW Heritage Office.
 10. No signage is part of this approval and shall require a separate application.
 11. Internal fitout works shall be submitted as a separate application.
 12. The details of the air-conditioning ducts, pipes and other service elements shall be submitted to and approved by the Director, NSW Heritage Office prior to commencement of works on site.
 13. A detailed program for conservation works for the Trades Hall including the building facades shall be prepared submitted to and approved by the Director, Heritage Office prior to issue of a Construction Certificate.
 14. Should any archaeological relics be uncovered, excavation shall be stopped and the NSW Heritage Office shall be informed immediately.
 15. Following the determination of the Integrated Development Application a separate application shall be submitted to the NSW Heritage Council in accordance with Section 60 of the Heritage Act 1977.
 16. Fire engineering approach to be undertaken for the BCA upgrade.
- 5.2 Gordon Railway Station – Easy Access Upgrade – s.60**

Gordon is perhaps the best surviving suburban station building group to retain an overhead

MINUTES OF THE HERITAGE COUNCIL APPROVALS COMMITTEE
Wednesday 4 February 2004 at the Heritage Office, 3 Marist Place,
Parramatta at 1.30pm

booking office with an island and a side platform. The signal box is housed in the end of the island building. The group is interesting because of its intact condition, its retention of significant detail and its use as an intermediate terminus with the use of the additional platform. Committee members considered the Easy Access Upgrading Application, inclusive of 3 lifts, accessible ramp, family accessible toilet, new canopies and modifications to booking office.

Resolution:

That the Heritage Council:

1. **Defer the application as the Development Application has, in the opinion of the Committee, an undue impact on the Heritage values of the site including:**
 - a) **The location and design of the lifts and associated structures are to be redesigned to be more sympathetic in scale, proportion form, colour and material, as it constricts the view from/to the heritage building;**
 - b) **The stair to Platforms 2 & 3 is to remain in alignment with the current provisions, being parallel to the edge of Platform 2. This will create a clearance of 2600 mm from the base of the stair to the edge of Platform 2;**
 - c) **The modifications to the original external envelope and internal fabric of the booking office, other than the widening of the existing opening in the provision of a family accessible toilet as indicated in Drawing DA02D, prepared by Suturs Architects and dated 26th September 2003, be deleted;**
2. **Request the detailed design of the lifts to be submitted for approval with the amended application.**

5.3 WITHDRAWN

5.4 Lee Wharf Development -Civic Railway Workshops, Newcastle - IDA

Civic Railway Workshops is one of the outstanding industrial workshop sites in the State and are excellent examples of a Victorian workshop group that display continuity, excellence in design and execution and add to the townscape of Newcastle as well as play an important role in the history of the railway in the area. The whole group is of highest significance in the State. The Approvals Committee considered the IDA put forward in its advice and resolved to;

Resolved:

(A) That the Heritage Council of NSW advise the Department of Infrastructure Planning and Natural Resources that upon the submission of amended plans which satisfy the following conditions, the Heritage Council is prepared to approve applications 230-05-2003, 231-05-2003 and 233-05-2003 under section 63 of the Heritage Act in the following general terms:

1. **The development of the site is to be in accordance with "Development Application" prepared by Crone Nation Architects, 27 May 2003, Drawings ADAZ - 0001(C), 0002(C), 1001(D), 1002(D), 1003(C), 1004(C), 1005(C), 1006(C), 1007(C), 1008(C), 1009(C), 1010(C), 1011(C), 1012(C), 1021(A), 1022(A), 2001(D), 2002(B), 2003(C), 2011(C), 2012(B), 3001(B), 3002(B), 9007(A), 9008(A), ADAB - 2141(A), 2142(A), 2143(A) prepared by Crone Nation Architects, DA - L01, L02, L03, L04, L05, L06 prepared by Oculus and Drawing 02/195 "Proposed lot boundaries"**

MINUTES OF THE HERITAGE COUNCIL APPROVALS COMMITTEE
Wednesday 4 February 2004 at the Heritage Office, 3 Marist Place,
Parramatta at 1.30pm

prepared by Monteath & Powys Surveyors, as amended by the following conditions.

2. That the part of Building B1 on levels 3, 4, 5 and 6 between grids B07 and B08 on Drawings by Crone Nation Architects being deleted in order to reduce the adverse impact on the former Divisional Engineers Office, Boiler House and Machine Shop (Hunter Valley Wine Society Building).
3. Applications under sections 60 and 140 of the Heritage Act are to be submitted to and approved by the Heritage Council prior to the commencement of construction or excavation for those parts of the site within and outside the boundaries of the State Heritage Register listing respectively.
4. The location of the driveway access to the Site A basement is to be as shown on Drawings Z-1021(A) and Z-1022(A) prepared by Crone Nation Architects.
5. The Norfolk Island Hibiscus tree located near the western end of the former Divisional Engineer's Office is to be protected from harm at all times during construction.
6. The proposed planting between the car park entry under Building B7 and the heritage item to the east should be designed in consultation with the owner and occupier of the adjoining land to screen the proposed car park entry but not intrude on view lines to the heritage building and from Wright Lane to Hunter Square and to have regard to the location of the Norfolk Island Hibiscus tree on the adjoining site.
7. A detailed landscape plan for Hunter Square Park is to be submitted to the Heritage Council under section 60 of the Heritage Act which addresses loss of visual connection between the former Boiler House and Machine Shop and Lee Wharf A and Harbour caused by the choice of planting and siting and transparency of the proposed pergola.
8. Details of the façade materials and colour treatments of the southern elevation of Building B7 and the southern and eastern elevations of Building B1 are to be submitted to the Heritage Council with the section 60 applications for those buildings which provide a solid base to those buildings and have a satisfactory relationship with the former Divisional Engineer's Office and Boiler House and Machine Shop.
9. Excavation which extends below the level of the base of the footings of the adjacent heritage items must protect the items from damage and if necessary support the buildings in a manner approved by the Principal Certifying Authority.
10. Vibration and structural monitoring is to be undertaken during critical and sensitive phases of the excavation and foundation construction to ensure that site conditions do not lead to vibration levels that could have a detrimental impact on the structural fabric of the heritage items.
11. An Archaeological Research Design is to be submitted to the Heritage Council in conjunction with the applications to be lodged under sections 60 and 140 of the Heritage Act which must include a comprehensive mitigation strategy in relation to:
 - subsurface disturbance for landscaping, grading and temporary work; and
 - the use of heavy machinery so that the proposed works do not directly impact on the areas immediately adjacent to the site boundary, as they are likely to contain significant archaeological remains associated with the Monier Sea Wall and other rare foreshore remains.
10. The approved excavation must be carried out under the direction of a nominated Excavation Director and in accordance with the approved Archaeological Research Design.
11. The Applicant must ensure that the Excavation Director and team are given sufficient time and access to the site to complete their work to the satisfaction of the Director of the NSW Heritage Office. If necessary, conflicting work schedules shall be adjusted to accommodate the archaeological excavation works.

MINUTES OF THE HERITAGE COUNCIL APPROVALS COMMITTEE
Wednesday 4 February 2004 at the Heritage Office, 3 Marist Place,
Parramatta at 1.30pm

12. Throughout the archaeological excavation works and post-excavation analysis, the applicant must ensure that:
 - appropriate signage to explain the history of the site and the archaeological excavation works is placed at the site during any archaeological excavation;
 - a local public information program is implemented including press releases to ensure the public is informed about the project and its outcomes;
 - the services of a conservator must be utilised for conservation of significant artefacts;
 - the NSW Heritage Office is to be notified, in writing, at least once a month of the progress of work during excavation and during post excavation analysis.
13. As part of a detailed site specific induction, all personnel involved in any demolition and excavation works are required to attend a comprehensive briefing on the requirements of the NSW Heritage Act, 1977 in relation to archaeological relics and the need for compliance with the proposed archaeological program approved as part of the s.60 application. Location maps of any potential archaeological sites must be distributed to all personnel and a signed record of attendance sheet created.
14. The nominated Excavation Director must immediately contact the NSW Heritage Office when relics not identified in 'Lee Wharf Newcastle Heritage Impact Statement' prepared by Godden Mackay Logan (2003) are disturbed by construction work on site.
15. At the completion of archaeological works, the results of the archaeological program are to be interpreted within the completed redevelopment of the site. This interpretation strategy must outline how the archaeological results will be publicly interpreted and is required to be submitted to the Director of the NSW Heritage Office for approval and then implemented to the satisfaction of the Director of NSW Heritage Office.
16. The required interpretation strategy must help the public understand the history and significance of the site and must include recommendations regarding the display of selected artefacts and other relevant material to help achieve this and a multimedia strategy. The interpretation strategy should include opportunities to interpret the technology used and adapted on site during the various periods of occupation as well as opportunities to describe the site within a wider State context and its impacts and contributions to associated industries. The alignment of former shorelines and seawalls, pre-railway occupation of the site including Aboriginal occupation, and the former rail usage of the site are to be recognised by the Interpretation Strategy.
17. The draft Interpretation Strategy is to be submitted to the NSW Heritage Office for comment within one month of the completion of excavation works on site.
18. The Interpretation Strategy is to be implemented to the satisfaction of the Director of the NSW Heritage Office prior to the release of any occupation certificate for the development.
19. The former turntable in the vicinity of Wright Lane is to be protected from harm and conserved in-situ before, during and after grading, landscaping and car park construction.
20. The existing rail lines servicing the former wharf structures are to be retained and conserved as far as practical within the proposed park.
21. The NSW Heritage Office must be informed of the commencement and completion of the archaeological program at least 5 days prior to the commencement and within 5 days of the completion of work on site.
22. The applicant is responsible for the safe-keeping of all relics recovered from the site.
23. The applicant must ensure that the Excavation Director cleans, stabilises, identifies, labels, catalogues and stores any artefacts uncovered from the site in a way that allows them to be retrieved according to both type and provenance.

MINUTES OF THE HERITAGE COUNCIL APPROVALS COMMITTEE
Wednesday 4 February 2004 at the Heritage Office, 3 Marist Place,
Parramatta at 1.30pm

24. The Heritage Council of NSW and the NSW Heritage Office reserve the right to inspect the site and records at all times and access any relics recovered from the site.
 25. In accordance with section 146(b) of the NSW Heritage Act, 1977, the Applicant must ensure that a final archaeological report is prepared by the nominated Excavation Director, to publication standard, within one (1) year of the conclusion of the project unless an extension of time is approved by the Director of the NSW Heritage Office. Two copies of this report must be submitted to the NSW Heritage Office. One electronic copy must also be submitted to the NSW Heritage Office. A further copy must be lodged in the local library or another appropriate local repository in the area in which the site is located.
 26. The Heritage Council of NSW requires that the final report shall include:
 - An executive summary
 - Due credit to the client undertaking the excavation on the title page
 - An accurate site location and site plan
 - Historical research, references, and bibliography
 - An archival photographic recording of the site prior to and during the archaeological investigation.
 - Detailed information on the excavation including the aim, the context for the excavation, procedures, post-excavation analysis, treatment of artefacts (such as cleaning, conserving, sorting, cataloguing, labelling, and scale drawings)
 - Nominated repository for the artefacts
 - Detailed response to research questions
 - Details of how this information about the excavation has been publicly disseminated
 27. If any Aboriginal relics are uncovered, excavation or disturbance of the area is to stop immediately and the National Parks and Wildlife Service is to be informed in accordance with Section 91 of the National Parks and Wildlife Act, 1974.
- (B) That the Heritage Council of NSW advise the Department of Infrastructure Planning and Natural Resources that
- it supports the recommendations of the Heritage Impact Statement for Lee Wharf Park, Newcastle prepared by Godden MacKay Logan (June 2003) in relation to DA 232-05-2003 and their implementation through conditions of consent; and
 - it has no objection, in terms of heritage impact, to the relocation of floor space deleted from Building B1 being added to the height of Building B2 or the northern part of Building B7.

6. Development Application Referrals

6.1 Queen Victoria Building – Upgrade Works Masterplan

The Approvals Committee will reconvene at The Queen Victoria Building on 13 Friday 2004 to consider the application more closely.

6.2 St Annes Bondi

St Anne's Shrine is a symbol of the role of the Catholic Church in the early growth of residential development in the Bondi Beach area from the 1920s. It is a fine representation of the Inter War period Romanesque style as interpreted by the prominent architect Joseph Fowell; of imposing scale and symbolism, establishing

MINUTES OF THE HERITAGE COUNCIL APPROVALS COMMITTEE
Wednesday 4 February 2004 at the Heritage Office, 3 Marist Place,
Parramatta at 1.30pm

a landmark presence on its open corner site. Committee members considered the application and gave the following advice;

Resolved;

That the Heritage Council advise Waverley Council that:

- 1. the applicant be advised that the State Heritage Register Committee is considering listing the Item on the SHR**
- 2. no objections are raised to the construction of the crying room and the relocation of the font;**
- 3. the application for removal and relocation of the altar rails should be refused as there is not enough information for their Heritage Significance to be determined;**
- 4. the applicant should be required to reinstate the altar rails and gates in their original position;**
- 5. the applicant should store correctly the altar rails and gates until a final decision about their future is determined**
- 6. that Council requests the reinstatement of the ventilation boxes to the pews wherever possible;**
- 7. that plans showing the reinstatement of the ventilation boxes be submitted to Council for approval prior to the work being carried out;**
- 8. that Council request that any heritage fabric or movable items removed from the interior are appropriately stored, covered and documented;**
- 9. that a Conservation Management Plan or Strategy be prepared to guide future management of the church and resolve conflict on heritage issues;**
- 10. the Conservation Management Plan or strategy is to be provided with all future development applications.**

7. Conservation management Plans

Members noted the Conservation Management Plan Status Report.

8. Matters for Consideration

8.1 St John's Darlinghurst – refusal by the Land and Environmental

St John's Church with its rectory, grounds and fence form the most intact 19th century group of church buildings in Sydney. The church building with its tower, spire, transepts and chancel is one of the few unaltered Edmund Blasket buildings in Australia and is the most richly executed Gothic Revival parish church in Australia.

An Integrated Development Application was received in June 2003 that proposed two new buildings on the site. The listed site is currently occupied by St John's Anglican Church, the Rectory, a 1960's church hall and a petrol station. The original church hall, also known as the school, was demolished in the 1960's and replaced with a petrol station. The disused petrol station, which occupies a part of the site to the north of the church, and the church hall, which occupies the south eastern part of the site, have been identified for re-development.

The Heritage Council and the Land and Environment Court have taken different stances with regard to the appropriateness or otherwise of the proposal. The Approvals Committee considered the differences in approach and considered what actions may be appropriate to reconcile them. The reasons for the Land and Environment Court decision are analysed and two recommendations were made.

MINUTES OF THE HERITAGE COUNCIL APPROVALS COMMITTEE
Wednesday 4 February 2004 at the Heritage Office, 3 Marist Place,
Parramatta at 1.30pm

Resolved

That the Heritage Council:

- **Note that the Heritage Office is currently completing the Managing Change policy paper and the University of Western Sydney paper on Economic Modelling, both papers being due for completion in April 2004.**
- **Request the Heritage Office to follow up the letter sent to Chief Judge Peter McLellan of the Land and Environment Court which offered a briefing to the Court on Heritage management and processes. The opportunity to brief the court on the Managing Change and the Economic Modelling policy papers should be taken at this time.**

8.2 Parramatta Rail Link – Parramatta Station

The Approvals Committee consider the extent and impact of the proposed modifications to the Parramatta Transport Interchange (PTI) to the significance of the Station as presented in the review of environmental factors (REF).

Resolved

That the Heritage Council:

- **find the design as amended in option two (2) to be generally satisfactory**
- **note that the sub-committee has in the past and will be continuing to work with the Applicant in the future to find a working compromise adequate to all parties.**
- **consider the extent and impact of the proposed modifications to the Parramatta Transport Interchange (PTI) to the significance of the Station as presented in the review of environmental factors (REF) prepared by Parramatta Rail Link Corporation on exhibition from 5 December, 2003 to 16 January, 2004 (available at www.raillink.nsw.gov.au) and presented to the Parramatta Rail Link (PRL) Heritage Council appointed Sub Committee at its meetings on 20 October, 2003, 10 December, 2003 and 20 January, 2004;**
- **consider the advice provided by the Parramatta Rail Link (PRL) Heritage Council appointed Sub Committee to Parramatta Rail Link Corporation concerning the impact of the proposal to be included in the review of environmental factors (REF) and representations report for submission to Department of Infrastructure, Planning and Natural Resources (DIPNR) for assessment and reporting to the Minister;**
- **if the Sub Committee's concerns remain outstanding following the presentation by PRL at the meeting scheduled for 20 January, 2004, provide advice as to the impact of the proposal on the significance of the Station to be submitted to PRL, DIPNR and to be reported to the Minister and**
- **note the endorsement of the conservation management plan for Parramatta Railway Station, reviewed by the PRL Sub Committee and endorsed under delegated authority.**

9. Matters for Information

341 George Street – Proposed Commercial Development

**MINUTES OF THE HERITAGE COUNCIL APPROVALS COMMITTEE
Wednesday 4 February 2004 at the Heritage Office, 3 Marist Place,
Parramatta at 1.30pm**

The committee will reconvene on site at 341 George Street, on Tuesday 10 February 2004 to consider the application more closely.

10. General Business

NIL

12. Next Meeting

The Chair closed the meeting at 4.20pm. The next meeting is scheduled for 3 March 2004.

Signed:

Date