

HERITAGE COUNCIL OF NSW Approvals Committee

MINUTES OF MEETING

3rd August 2005

NSW Heritage Office, 3 Marist Place, Parramatta



PRESENT	Mary -Lynne Taylor Jacqui Goddard Susan Macdonald Bruce Pettman Megan Jones David Logan Peter Mould Rod Leaver Diane Jones	Chair Assistant Director, Heritage Office
APOLOGIES	Gary Prattley	
ALSO PRESENT	Vincent Sicari Nikki Ward Ed Beebe Gary Pringle Brad Vale Can Ercan	Heritage Office Heritage Office Heritage Office Heritage Office Heritage Office Heritage Office
OTHERS	Glorio De Angelis Alix Cai Graham Brooks Neil Slater Dannielle Psarris Gary Webb Ed Clode Barney Collins Lester Munro Anthony Quan Peter de Monford	

1. Opening – Welcome

The Chair opened the meeting at 1:30pm.

1.2 Confirmation and Timing of Agenda

The agenda was confirmed.

1.3 Declarations of Interest

Pecuniary Interests

NIL

Non Pecuniary Interests

NIL

Conflicts of Interest

NIL

2.0 Confirmation of Minutes

2.1 Approvals Committee Meeting of 6 July 2005

Members received a copy of the minutes.

Recommendation :

that the Minutes of the meetings of 6 July 2005 be adopted.

3.0 Action Report

Members received a copy of the action report.

Recommendation :

that the Action Report of the meetings of 6 July 2005 be adopted.

4 Presentations

4.1 Warby's Barn, 20 Queen St, Campbelltown – IDA

The applicant presented plans for two new four and six storey multi unit residential apartment buildings. A CMP was prepared for the site and submitted with the application. The applicant submitted that the design was intended to limit the affect on the views and setting of the barn as the height of the rear apartment block would minimise its impact on the significant view of the barn from Queens Street. It was submitted that the height of the buildings would be 'sympathetic to' rather than 'equivalent to' the height of the barn. The design of the landscaping was intended to retain an interpretation of the building's rural setting by the use of paving, flat kerbs and indigenous trees. Proposed lap pool and play area were relocated and/or deleted to limit the impact on the area between the Barn and the Stables which is identified a having archaeological potential. A row of trees act as a screen between the barn and the apartment buildings with the aim of having a canopy as high as possible. The CMP advised that the scale, character and architectural language of new buildings should relate to the existing building in an acceptable manner.

4.2 Nobbys Head Lighthouse and Signal Station – S60

Amended designs compliant with the Committee's design suggestions were presented to the Committee: maintaining the gap between the lighthouse and signal station; kitchen size reduced; removal of internal access to public toilets; reduced tourist accommodation suites; reduced patron capacity for the restaurant to 30 people; and capital investments reduced by 10%. The applicant expressed the view to the Approvals Committee that a reduction in the size of the developments, in the manner described above, would not be financially viable, and that it may not be necessary to keep the gap between the lighthouse and signal station - noting silhouette views of the headland from various angles. The Committee advised that it is still awaiting information from a sub-committee meeting on the site.

4.3 Helensburgh Railway Station – S60

The design for a new overhead footbridge to the station platform was presented to the Committee. The footbridge was designed with the aim of discouraging use of the road bridge as a drop-off point for passengers arriving at the station by car – safety concerns (road is used by cars and buses, who do 3 point turns in narrow space at entrance to fire trail on north end of bridge). The footbridge included 3 lift towers and a ramp on the northern end, connecting with Wilsons Creek Road for disability access. It was pointed out that the height of the lifts could not be reduced due to OH&S and maintenance issues.

5. Integrated Development Applications/Section 60 and 132 Applications/Section 140 Excavation permits

5.1 Warby's Barn, 20 Queen St, Campbelltown - IDA

The Committee expressed concern about the proximity of the new buildings to the barn and the height of the new buildings in relation to the barn in particular the height of the rear Block B. There was also concern that the proposed trees used as a screen in the area between the barn and the new buildings would compromise the intention of maintaining an open, rural appearance with open views of the Barn from Queen Street. The Committee was also concerned that the architectural design of the new buildings would not complement the character of the barn. To reduce the impact of the new buildings on the view of the barn from Queen Street, the Committee requested that design changes be made to lower the basement car-park to be fully underground, reduce the height of Block B to no higher than the Barn's ridge, lower the height of the roofs by either reversing the slope or providing a lower pitch or flat roof. As Block A will become a backdrop to the barn as seen from the Stables, the elevation of the lower half of Block A should be redesigned with materials that acknowledge the character of the Barn.

Resolved:

That the Heritage Council advise Campbelltown City Council in accordance with Section 91A of the Environmental Planning and Assessment Act 1979 that the following terms of approval are proposed to be granted.:

- 1) The proposed development involving the construction of two multi unit residential apartment buildings and underground carparking and refurbishment of Warby's Barn as residential units is to be carried out in accordance with:**
 - a) Drawings Nos. DA01/B, DA02/C, DA03/C, DA04/B, DA05/C, DA06/C, DA07/B, DA08/B, DA09/B, DA10/B, DA11/B, DA101/A, DA102/A, DA103/A, DA104/A, DA105/A, DA106/A, DA107/A;**
 - b) Heritage Impact Assessment dated November, 2004, prepared by Graham Brooks & assoc. Pty Ltd,**
 - c) Review of Archaeological & Development Impact Assessment dated 17 June, 2005 prepared by Archaeological & Heritage Management Solutions Pty Ltd; and**
 - d) Conservation Management Plan dated November, 2004 prepared by Graham Brooks & assoc. Pty Ltd**

Design Revision

- 2) The following design revisions are to be made to reduce the impact of Block A and B on the significant views and setting of the Barn. The revisions are to be submitted to the Director of the Heritage Office to be approved prior to the determination of the development application by Campbelltown City Council:**
 - a) The height of Block B is to be no higher than the ridge line of the Barn;**
 - b) The proposed underground carpark is to be lowered so it is fully underground;**
 - c) The height of the Block A and B roofs are to be lowered by either reversing the slope and/or providing a lower pitch or flat roof;**

- d) As Block A will become a backdrop to the barn seen from the neighbouring Stables, the elevation of the lower half of Block A should be redesigned to make it complement the character of the barn and include materials that acknowledge the character of the Barn;**
- e) The proposed large trees at the rear of the Barn should be deleted.**

Further Information

- 3) The following information is to be submitted to the Director of the Heritage Office to be approved prior to the release of the construction certificate:**
 - a) Details of the proposed adaptation works to the barn to convert it to residential units and to open the blocked central arches to form the new gallery. The new internal layout of the barn is to retain an understanding and interpretation of the former open internal planing. New internal elements should be lightweight to distinguish them from the original masonry. New finishes and materials should be contemporary to ensure they are clearly identified as new.**
 - b) A Schedule of Conservation Works for the barn in accordance with the December 2003 Conservation Management Plan, updated with greater detail to reflect the building's current condition, removal of intrusive materials and proposed works. The conservation documents are to be prepared and the works supervised by the nominated heritage consultant. The works are to be undertaken by qualified contractors in accordance with the conditions of approval;**
 - c) An interpretation plan for the site is to be prepared in accordance with the Heritage Council's Interpretation Guidelines;**
 - d) Details of the proposed infrastructure and landscaping to confirm location and species of proposed trees and planting; design, materials and colours of the driveway, paths and fences and location and design of letterboxes and relocated substation;**
- 4) The Strata Management Statements (or any other building management documents) for the site are to include By-laws or other measures to ensure that ownership of the barn's significant fabric (primarily the masonry walls)**

gallery and interpretation is by the site owner's corporation and conservation of significant fabric in accordance with the Conservation Management Plan is to be the responsibility of the corporation and adequate funds provided in any building maintenance fund for this work. This information is to be submitted to the Director of the Heritage Office to be approved prior to release of the occupancy certificate;

Nominated Heritage Consultant

- 5) A built heritage consultant and an archaeologist are to be nominated for the project. The consultants shall have appropriate qualifications and experience commensurate with the scope of the works. The name and details of the experience of the consultants shall be submitted to the Heritage Office for approval prior to the release of the construction certificate;**
- 6) The nominated consultants shall advise on:
 - a) detail design resolution of new elements, the demolition and removal to ensure there is no loss of significant fabric and elements, and there is reuse of salvageable material;**
 - b) construction of new elements, partitions, reticulation and impact of services (to minimise impacts on significant fabric, openings and views) and conformity to the conditions of approval;****
- 7) A monthly report by the consultants shall be submitted to the Director of the NSW Heritage Office for approval which describes the work, any impacts/damage and remedial works carried out;**

Archaeology

- 8) Should any Aboriginal objects be uncovered, excavation or disturbance of the area is to stop immediately and the Department of Environment and Conservation is to be informed in accordance with section 91 of the 'National Parks and Wildlife Act, 1974'.**
- 9) Any excavation which reveals Aboriginal objects must be referred to the Aboriginal Liaison Officer at the NSW Heritage Office (Ph.: 02 9873 8500) as well as the Department of Environment and Conservation. Contact for the Department of Environment and Conservation: Hurstville - (02) 9585 6444 (Head Office) and Parramatta - (02) 9895 7420**
- 10) Prior to the commencement of the proposed works, all contractors and relevant personnel involved are to be made aware of the existence of historical archaeological remains at the site by way of an induction process undertaken by the archaeologist acting as the nominated heritage consultant. The induction shall also make the personnel aware of the possibility of additional unidentified archaeological remains may still exist and of the requirements of the Heritage Act, 1977 in relation to archaeological relics in the event that they are uncovered.**
- 11) Suitable clauses, prepared in consultation with nominated heritage consultant, are to be included in all contractor and subcontractor contracts to ensure that on-site personnel are aware of their statutory obligations in relation to the relics provisions of the NSW Heritage Act 1977 and the National Parks and Wildlife Act, 1974 concerning Aboriginal archaeology.**
- 12) If any unidentified historical archaeological remains or deposits are exposed during the works (other than remains of nineteenth century timber fence posts and mid twentieth century outbuildings) excavation is to cease immediately in the affected areas and the excavation director is to be notified to undertake an evaluation of the potential extent and significance of such relics. The NSW Heritage Office is to be notified in accordance with Section 146 of the Heritage Act. Additional assessment and approval may be required prior to works continuing in the affected area based on the nature of the discovery.**

- 13) A work method statement is to be submitted to the Director of the Heritage Office for approval prior to the commencement of the works to describe the proposed ground and landscaping works and provision of any subsurface service reticulation in the part of the site bounded by the north east boundary, Block A and Block B and Queen Street to confirm that the work will not impact on undisturbed ground levels below existing paving and concrete paving slabs.**

Works

- 14) The new internal layout of the barn is to be designed and positioned to retain an understanding and interpretation of the original function and plan. New internal elements should be lightweight to distinguish them from the original masonry. New finishes and materials should be contemporary to ensure they are clearly identified as new. Implementation of the work should be inspected and certified by the nominated heritage consultant to ensure works are completed with approved documentation;**
- 15) Significant building elements, features, fixtures, fittings and fragile materials shall be adequately protected during the works from potential damage. Protection systems must ensure historic fabric is not damaged or removed;**
- 16) The installation of services shall be carried out in such a manner as to minimise damage to or removal of historic fabric and shall not obscure historic features. Service runs should be grouped and concealed within the new work. Penetrations through heritage fabric for supply and waste pipes and mechanical ducts should be avoided. New services should not detrimentally effect significant spaces, views and fabric;**

Archival Record

- 17) An archival record of the barn, in accordance with NSW Heritage Office guidelines, is to be submitted to the Director of the Heritage Office for approval within 3 months of the completion of the works. Copies of the archival record shall be deposited with the NSW Heritage Office and Campbelltown Council's local studies collection.**

S60 application

- 18) An application under section 60 of the NSW Heritage Act is to be submitted and must be approved by the NSW Heritage Council prior to the issue of a construction certificate.**

5.2 Land Titles Office, 1 Prince Albert Road, Sydney – S60

A proposal was made to alter the loading dock to replace a ramp connecting the basement with the street, with an external lift and fire control room. The Committee approved of the plans presented but suggested that the height of the fire control room be reduced by 400mm and that it be set at least 1m away from the nearest sandstone wall.

Resolved:

That the Heritage Council approve the application with the following conditions:

- 1) The works must be undertaken in accordance with drawings S01, S02, S03, S04, S05 and S06 Revision P1, prepared by Waterman AHW Pty Ltd, except for the following permitted variations;**
 - a) the fire control room is to be reduced in height by a minimum of 400mm;**
 - b) the existing concrete slab and beams over the loading dock may be demolished; and**
 - c) the fire control panel and security office of postwar construction in the foyer of the southern façade must be removed and the surrounding surfaces made good to match original fixtures and finished.**
- 2) The selection of all exterior finishes on the proposed lift and fire control room must be submitted and approved by the Director before construction may commence.**
- 3) The applicant must ensure that should any archaeological deposits or relics be unexpectedly uncovered during the work then excavation or disturbance of the area is to stop immediately and the Heritage Council of NSW is to be informed in accordance with Section 146 of the *Heritage Act, 1977*.**
- 4) The applicant must ensure that should any Aboriginal objects be unexpectedly uncovered during the work then excavation or disturbance of the area is to stop**

immediately and the Department of Environment and Conservation is to be informed in accordance with Section 91 of the *National Parks and Wildlife Act, 1974*.

- 5) This approval shall be void if the activity to which it refers is not physically commenced within five years after the date of the approval or within the period of consent specified in the relevant development consent granted under the *Environmental Planning and Assessment Act, 1979*, whichever occurs first.**

5.3 Helensburgh Railway Station – S60

The Committee questioned the necessity of a ramp and lift at the north side of the platform, near Wilsons Creek Road. The ramp was seen as an unnecessarily large and imposing structure. The Committee also expressed concern about safety for disability access from Wilsons Creek Road as there is no turning space for vehicles on this road to be able to safely drop off and pick up passengers. The Committee also questioned why disability access could not be directed to the southern side of the platform, with the utilisation of lift access already planned.

Resolved:

That the Heritage Council,

1) Defer the application for the following reasons:

- a) The bulk of the proposed lift towers forms an unacceptable adverse impact on the heritage significance of the Helensburgh Railway Station;**
- b) The materials proposed for the lift towers such as the amount of precast concrete increase the impact of the proposal; and**
- c) An impact assessment on the removal of a significant tree due to the construction of the lift tower on Wilson Creek Road was not provided.**

2) Request RailCorp to consider the following options:

- a) Removal of the lift tower and ramp on Wilson Creek Road.**

- b) Revision of facade design for the lift towers to reflect the precast concrete walls so that they stop short of the footbridge floor level; and integration of translucent structure over the bridge with the use of steel, glass and/or timber.**

6. Development Application Referrals

NIL

7. Conservation Management Plans

7.1 CMP Report

Resolved:

The committee noted the CMP report. The Chair noted that the backlog is continuing to decline.

8.0 Matters for Consideration

NIL

9.0 Matters for Information

NIL

10.0 General Business

The accuracy of the detailed wording of the Heritage Council resolutions at the meetings of the Approvals Committee was discussed and suggestions made in this regard.

There being no further business the Chair closed the meeting at 5:00pm.

Mary-Lynne Taylor
Chair
Approvals Committee
Heritage Council of NSW
Date:

Next Meeting of the Approvals Committee
Tuesday 13 September 2005
NSW Heritage Office
3 Marist Place
Parramatta