

HERITAGE COUNCIL OF NSW Approvals Committee

MINUTES OF MEETING

4 June 2008

Heritage Branch, Department of Planning,
3 Marist Place, Parramatta



-
- PRESENT:** Peter Mould (Chair), Chris Johnson, Julie Bindon, Diane Jones, Rajeev Maini (for Director, Heritage Branch)
- APOLOGIES:** David Logan
- ALSO PRESENT:** Heritage Branch: Nikki Ward, Siobhan Lavelle, Gary Estcourt, Bronwyn Hanna
- For Commonwealth Bank: John Dillon and Andrea Roberts (Colonial First State), Michael Taylor (TSA Management Pty Ltd), Megan Jones (Tanner Architects)

1. Opening – Welcome

The Chair opened the meeting at 11:25 am.

1.2 Confirmation and Timing of Agenda

The agenda was confirmed.

Declarations of Interest

- Julie Bindon – Item 5.2 (161-167 Castlereagh Street & 232-248 Pitt Street, Sydney) – JBA Urban Planning Consultants Pty Ltd Consulting are planning consultants on this project
- Item 6.1 (Commonwealth Bank, 108-120 Pitt Street, Sydney) – JBA Urban Planning Consultants Pty Ltd Consulting are planning consultants on this project

2. Confirmation of Minutes

2.1 Approvals Committee Meeting of 7 May 2008

Members received a copy of the minutes.

Resolved:

that the Minutes of the meeting of 7 May 2008 be adopted.

3. Action Report

Members received a copy of the action report.

Resolved:

that the Action Report of the meeting of 7 May 2008 be adopted.

5. Integrated Development Applications/Section 60 and 132 Applications/Section 140 Excavation permits

5.1 Harbour Rocks Hotel, 34-52 Harrington St, The Rocks – IDA

Consideration

The proposed works involve installation of a new lift, ground floor conversion of office area into a restaurant, new rooms on various levels and conversion of existing spaces to accommodate development. A majority of the work will affect the newer parts of the building and non-original fabric. The Approvals Committee supported the proposed changes, however they highlighted a need to revisit the design of the new parapet in front of the proposed lift overrun or reduce its height in order to lessen its impact. Recessive fabric could be used on the corner of the lift shaft that may, as a result, still be visible at street level.

Resolved:

- 1) **All work shall be carried out in accordance with the following documentation:**
 - a) **Harbour Rocks Hotel Project Drawings prepared by Peter Shepherd Consulting, dated January 2008;**
 - b) **Statement of Environmental Effects prepared by Peter Shepherd Consulting, dated January 2008; and**
 - c) **Heritage Impact Statement prepared by Orwell and Peter Phillips Architects, dated January 2008.**

EXCEPT AS AMENDED by the conditions of this consent.

- 2) **That the new parapet wall to the lift facing Harrington Street be minimised in height to the satisfaction of the Director, Heritage Branch, Department of Planning.**

- 3) The new opening in the southern wall of Evan's Store providing access to the Terraces is to be located wholly within the niche of the arch with no modifications made to the existing piers of the arch.
- 4) Brickwork that is removed from the niche is to be removed in such a manner so as to allow it to be reused for infilling the existing doorway in the other niche.

Further Information:

- 5) A detailed interpretation plan shall be submitted to and approved by the Heritage Council with the S60 application prior to commencement of works.

Nominated Heritage Consultant:

- 6) All heritage work shall be supervised by a qualified heritage consultant to ensure that the impact of the works on the heritage significance of the building is minimised and all work has been carried out in accordance with the approved documentation and the conditions of this consent.
- 7) All work shall be carried out by suitably qualified tradesmen with practical experience in conservation and restoration of similar heritage items. The nominated heritage consultant in Condition 5 shall be consulted prior to the selection of appropriate tradesmen.

Site Protection & Works:

- 8) Significant built elements are to be adequately protected during the works from potential damage. Protection systems must ensure historic fabric is not damaged or removed.
- 9) The chimney stack between the two northernmost terraces must be reconstructed as outlined in the documentation accompanying this application.
- 10) The rear portion of the roof of the northernmost terrace must be reconstructed as outlined in the documentation accompanying this application.
- 11) Internal walls to be removed in the significant areas of the buildings should be removed by hand rather than by machine demolition to preserve any adjoining significant fabric.
- 12) If the detailed design of the proposed work (i.e. detailed construction, mechanical drawings or compliance with disabled access) necessitates any amendments to the approved documentation as outlined in Condition 1, a S65 application under the Heritage Act 1977 shall be lodged with the Heritage Office to modify this consent.

Archival Recording and Interpretation:

- 13) An archival photographic recording of the affected internal and external aspects is undertaken prior to the commencement of

works, in accordance with the Heritage Council document, *How to prepare archival Records of Heritage Items*. The original copy of the archival record shall be deposited with the Heritage Office, an additional copy shall be provided to the Sydney Harbour Foreshore Authority.

- 14) An onsite display, consistent with the approved interpretation plan, which allows a full interpretation of the site including the demolished features to be made, shall be installed at the completion of the proposed works.**

Compliance:

- 15) Following the determination of the development application by the Sydney Harbour Foreshore Authority, an application under Section 60 of the NSW Heritage Act 1977 must be submitted to and approved by the NSW Heritage Council.**

5.2 161-167 Castlereagh Street & 232-248 Pitt Street, Sydney – S140

Consideration

The proposal for this site involves construction of a multi-storey building with basement retail and car parking. Archaeological assessment has identified the likely presence of remains of State significance on the site. The application submitted to the Heritage Council, therefore, is for large-scale archaeological salvage excavation (Stage 1) to be followed by archaeological monitoring of bulk excavation for the new development (Stage 2).

As this is considered a highly significant site, The Approvals Committee requested that the applicant and developer make a presentation to the Heritage Council's Approvals Committee to provide further detail on the scope of works. It was noted that care be taken to ensure that the Excavation Director for the site be qualified and highly experienced in managing archaeological excavations on a State significant site. As the Approvals Committee was not quorate for this item it was decided that consideration of this application should be deferred to a future meeting.

6. Development Application Referrals and Major Project Application Referrals Under Part 3A of EP&A Act

6.1 Commonwealth Bank, 108-120 Pitt Street, Sydney – DAR

Presentation

The proponent provided a briefing on Stage 1 of the development application for the site which includes the original head office building for the Commonwealth Bank, upon which its iconic 'moneybox' piggy bank is modelled. As the building complex will be vacated by the Commonwealth Bank in 2010-2011, the applicant

is seeking to modify the current building. The changes involve major adaptation, renovation and additions in preparation for new tenants on the site, also enabling better circulation within the building. "Vertical extension" of the site is proposed in order to create greater floor space. While not explicitly in the proposal, reinstatement of the lightwells in the 1933 extension are being considered to enable more natural lighting into the building. Consideration has been given to the impacts of the proposed tower extension on the neighbouring MLC building complex and courtyard and on Martin Place in line with LEP constraints, with particular regard to setbacks and natural lighting. The proponent also outlined some key points of difference between the CMP and the Council's Heritage and Urban Design Report relating to continued use of the site for banking purposes, which may not be the case with new tenants, and issues relating to vertical extensions to the building.

Consideration

The Approvals Committee considered that it would be useful to have an endorsed CMP for the site against which the proposed works could be compared. The Committee concurred on two principles: that any refurbishment of the 1916-1933 'moneybox' building should include reinstating its lightwell and that the proposed tower should not intrude upon the envelope of the original 'moneybox' building. The Committee believed good economic outcomes for the site would be possible and feasible if the heritage qualities of the 'money box' building were restored and enhanced.

Resolved:

That the Heritage Council:

- 1) notes the presentation;**
- 2) requests the expeditious review of the CMP and to report back to the next Heritage Council meeting.**
- 3) considers that the reinstatement of the lightwell in the 1916-1933 building is of paramount importance and that any consideration of development above the lightwell would be seen to compromise its integrity.**
- 4) supports the reinstatement of the original and significant design concepts and elements in the 1916-1933 building.**
- 5) that future new development should be restricted to outside the primary 1916-1933 building envelope.**

7.0 Matters for Consideration

7.1 Brewarrina Fish Traps – CMP for endorsement

Consideration

The Approvals Committee was requested to consider endorsement of the Conservation Management Plan for the Brewarrina fishtraps, entitled 'Looking After Baiame's Ngunnhu'. The local Aboriginal community of the Brewarrina area would like a management regime firmly in place for future preservation and management of the site.

Resolved:

That the Heritage Council State Heritage Register Committee:

- 1) **Endorses the conservation management plan titled "Looking after Baiame's Ngunnhu, Conservation Management Plan for the Brewarrina Fishtraps" prepared by Sam Rando for the Northern Star Aboriginal Corporation, Brewarrina dated June 2007 for a period of 5 years subject to the following matters being addressed to the satisfaction of the Director of the Heritage Branch:**
 - a) **That the CMP policies under section 10.3 "Repairing the Ngunnhu" numbers 7 and 16 be amended to include reference to obligations under the *Heritage Act 1977* for managers to seek approval from the Heritage Council.**
 - b) **That the CMP include a recommendation that the State Heritage Register boundary of the site be reviewed.**
 - c) **That the CMP include a recommendation that the potential for renaming the site with its Aboriginal place name be investigated.**
- 2) **Agrees that the endorsed CMP will provide a guiding document for the Heritage Council in its consideration of any proposals for change to or involving the item that is the subject of the CMP, for the period of the endorsement.**
- 3) **Advises the applicant that endorsement of this CMP indicates an acceptance of policies that may guide development in future. Any future development proposal will have to be considered with respect to information at hand at the time, public submissions and likely impact on the significance of the subject heritage item.**

8.0 Matters for Information

NIL

9.0 General Business

NIL

There being no further business the Chair closed the meeting 1:55 pm.

Peter Mould Chair Approvals Committee Heritage Council of NSW	Next Meeting of the Approvals Committee 2 July, 2008 3 Marist Place Parramatta
--	--