

HERITAGE COUNCIL OF NSW

Approvals Committee



MINUTES OF MEETING

4 July 2007

Heritage Office, 3 Marist Place, Parramatta

PRESENT: Michael Collins (Chair), Susan Macdonald, Chris Johnson, David Logan, Julie Bindon, Janet Dore, Bruce Pettman, Diane Jones.

APOLOGIES: Peter Mould

ALSO PRESENT: Heritage Office: Vincent Sicari, Nikki Ward, Murat Gul, Brad Vale, Siobhan Lavelle, Alice Brandjes.

For Sydney Town Hall: Howard Tanner (Tanner & Associates), Geoff Brew (City of Sydney)

For Mariners' Church: Ian Kelly & Graham Robertson (Sydney Harbour Foreshore Authority), Otto Cserhalmi & Gary Booth (Otto Cserhalmi & Partners), Adam Solomons & Christine McHanna (Woods Bagot)

1. Opening – Welcome

The Chair opened the meeting at 10:55 am.

1.2 Confirmation and Timing of Agenda

The agenda was confirmed.

Declarations of Interest

Pecuniary Interests

Michael Collins

Item 5.1 (Mariners' Church) – Michael Collins is a Board member of SHFA which owns this property and is the applicant.

David Logan

Item 5.2 (Lidcombe Hospital) – Godden Mackay Logan is the heritage consultant to Australand on this project.

Bruce Pettman

The Department of Commerce GAO is involved in the Sydney Town Hall refurbishment project and façade conservation.

Non Pecuniary Interests

Michael Collins

Item 5.1 (Mariners' Church) – Michael Collins is a Board member of SHFA which owns this property and is the applicant.

NIL

Conflicts of Interest

Michael Collins

Item 5.1 (Mariners' Church) – Michael Collins is a Board member of SHFA which owns this property and is the applicant.

Chris Johnson

Item 5.1 (Mariners' Church) – Chris Johnson is on the SHFA Board.

2. Confirmation of Minutes

2.1 Approvals Committee Meeting of 6 June 2007

Members received a copy of the minutes.

Resolved:

that the Minutes of the meeting of 6 June 2007 be adopted.

3. Action Report

Members received a copy of the action report.

Resolved:

that the Action Report of the meeting of 6 June 2007 be adopted

4. Presentations

4.1 Sydney Town Hall – Pre-DA

Howard Tanner (Tanner Architects) provided an overview of the proposed works to upgrade the Sydney Town Hall, highlighting the potential discovery and removal of skeletal remains below the Peace Hall. The upgrade works are to bring the Town Hall up to BCA compliance standards, meet Place of Public Entertainment licensing standards, upgrade essential services, upgrade and refurbish the Peace Hall, provide office accommodation and curatorial facilities, and carry out other miscellaneous works related to maintenance, repair and installation of contemporary services.

While sections of the ground below the Peace Hall have previously been excavated to install pipes and conduit, ground penetrating x-rays are currently being used to indicate the presence and location of any possible skeletal remains from the Old Sydney Burial Ground below the Town Hall, before construction of

the proposed basement plant room and kitchen stores room beneath the Peace Hall. The proponent advised the Heritage Council's Approvals committee that monthly advisory committee meetings would continue with regard to archaeology, and construction timeframes would be flexible to accommodate management of any archaeological remains.

4.2 Mariners' Church, The Rocks – S60

Ian Kelly (Sydney Harbour Foreshore Authority) presented an outline of the proposed renovation works to the Mariners' Church at The Rocks. Proposed renovations aim to make the building more publicly accessible, converting the space into a multi-storey upmarket restaurant/bar. The 1909 original staircase within the building would be demolished, as in order to meet BCA and other requirements the stairwell would need to be re-built. The George Street streetscape would be impacted due to construction of a glazed roof enclosure over new stairs leading up to level 4. A transparent enclosure was chosen to ensure there was no interruption to interpretation of the original building. Variations on possible placements for a stairwell leading from level 2 to level 4 from the George Street entrance to the building were discussed, along with the impact this would have on functionality of rooms on the western side of the building. It was explained that the decision on the location for the stairwell was determined on the basis of ensuring minimal effect on internal fabric and external visual impact as well as functional necessity. This placement would also allow disabled access from the highest point in George Street relative to the building. The existing main stairwell within the building can be used as a fire escape. A previously existing balcony on level 4 on the eastern side of the building would also be reinstated.

5. Integrated Development Applications/Section 60 and 132 Applications/Section 140 Excavation permits

5.1 Mariners' Church, The Rocks – S60

Due to Michael Collins' declaration of interest with this building, Janet Dore was Acting Chair for this item.

The applicant proposed to upgrade the Mariner's Church for an upmarket restaurant/bar facility. The works would include some demolition and the installation of new services such as new lifts, stairs, toilets and other associated facilities. The proposed works would have some impact on the significant fabric, the existing plan layout and external appreciation of the building from George Street.

Members of the Approvals Committee were concerned that the enclosure over the outdoor section of the stairwell in the South West corner of the building would be inconsistent with the current architectural expression and integrity of the building's facade. They were also concerned the proposed design could set a precedent for impact on the streetscape with regard to potential development of other buildings in George Street. Proposed materials for the balcony balustrade on the eastern side of the building, level 4, were also seen as not sympathetic with the existing building fabric and design. Further, the committee discussed

the possibility of re-designing the stairwell proposed for the south west corner of the building's interior to see if it would be possible to completely enclose the stairwell within the building.

Resolved:

That the Heritage Council approve the application with the following conditions:

- 1) All works shall be carried out in accordance with the following documentation:
 - a) Drawings Demo 01 to Demo 06 (inclusive); DA 01 to DA15 (inclusive) prepared by Otto Cserhalmi & Partners dated April, May, 10 May 2007 and 11 May 2007;
 - b) Statement of Heritage Impact prepared by Otto Cserhalmi & Partners dated May 2007;
 - c) Conservation Management Plan prepared by Graham Brooks and Associates dated 1 April 2005;
 - d) Electrical and Mechanical services drawings (Revision B) prepared by Wood & Grieve Engineers dated 8 May 2007;
 - e) Hydraulic Services drawings (Issue A) prepared by Warren Smith & Partners dated April 2007;
 - f) BCA Assessment Report prepared by Davis Langdon dated 27 April 2007;
 - g) Fire Safety Upgrade Strategy prepared by ARUP dated 30 April 2007; and
 - h) Fire Services Design Brief prepared by Warren Smith & Partners dated 7 May 2007.

And EXCEPT AS AMENDED by the following conditions

- 2) The position of the new entry lobby stairs shall be fully investigated for relocation to the north-west corner of the building as the Heritage Council thinks it would be less visually intrusive.
- 3) An alternative design shall be developed to achieve a more sympathetic enclosure over the proposed new stair.
- 4) All work shall be supervised by an appropriately qualified heritage consultant. The name and details of the nominated heritage consultants shall be submitted Heritage Office, Department of Planning prior to commencement of work. The nominated heritage consultant shall write monthly reports to the Executive Director, Heritage Office to confirm that the work has been carried out in accordance with the approved documentation and conditions of this approval.
- 5) Prior to the commencement of work a photographic archival recording of the whole building shall be prepared in accordance with the relevant Heritage Office guidelines.
- 6) The following design documentation together with the assessment of their impact on the fabric shall be submitted to and approved by the Executive Director, Heritage Office or his nominee prior to the commencement of work:
 - a) Details of the proposed new entry lobby stair, including its position and its external enclosure.
 - b) Details of all demolition works affecting significant fabric;
 - c) Details of the proposed balustrades on the western façade;
 - d) Details of all roof penetrations;
 - e) Details of services affecting significant fabric;
 - f) Details of new toilets;

- g) Details of new walls and their connections to the significant fabric;
 - h) Details of the air intake grilles and impact on the surrounding wall.
 - i) Details of the proposed balustrade treatment on level 4 (other than glazing).
 - j) Location of bar openings from central room to northern and southern rooms;
 - k) Details of the new lifts and stairs;
 - l) Details of new wall and bulkhead along the eastern wall of the 1927 Chapel;
 - m) The extent and details of the new openings between the 1909 Chapel and adjoining rooms and the proposed bulkhead;
 - n) The details of all modifications/upgrade works recommended in the technical reports mentioned in 'Conditions 1. f, g and h' together with an assessment of impact on the significance of the building.
 - o) Sample board showing all new materials, finishes and colours; and
 - p) A detailed schedule of conservation works including the sandstone walls and other significant fabric. The approved conservation works shall be carried out together with the other works approved under this approval.
- 7) An interpretation strategy and plan shall be submitted to and approved by the Executive Director, Heritage Office or his nominee prior to the commencement of work. The approved interpretation plan shall be completed prior to the completion of work.
- 8) No signage is part of this approval.
- 9) No excavation is part of this approval.

5.2 Lidcombe Hospital – IDA

The applicant sought approval for the adaptive reuse of the Vernon wards and the Superintendent's Residence on the west side of the Village Green as residential units and associated landscape works within the Heritage Precinct of the former Lidcombe Hospital site. The proposed works included the demolition of later additions, internal alterations, new additions at the rear of the wards and erection of car-ports and fences and associated landscape work.

The Approvals Committee queried the extent of coverage, and materials used for louvers on the balconies. Also, the Committee questioned the bulk, scale and roof pitch of the infill building at Building 04.

Resolved:

That the Heritage Council approves this application with the following conditions:

- 1) All works shall be carried out in accordance with the following documentation:
 - a) Drawing DA81-1000 (Issue J) dated 16 January 2007 prepared by Allen Jack+Cottier;
 - b) Drawings (Issue H) Nos. DA81-1101 to 1105, 1201 to 1204, 3101 to 3106, 3201 to 3209 dated 9 May 2006 prepared by Allen Jack+Cottier;

- c) Drawings (Issue J) Nos DA81-1001 and 1002, 2101 to 2105, 2201 to 2205 dated 16 January 2007 prepared by Allen Jack+Cottier;
 - d) Measured Drawings (Issue H) MD-2101 to 2105, 2201 to 2205, 3101 to 3104, 3201 to 3208 dated 9 May 2006 prepared by Allen Jack+Cottier;
 - e) Landscape Plan L01 OF L02 dated July 2005 prepared by Mather & Associates
 - f) Heritage Impact statement prepared by Godden Mackay Logan Pty. Ltd., dated May 2006.
 - g) Addendum to Heritage Impact Statement dated 24 January 2007 prepared by Godden Mackay Logan Pty. Ltd;
 - h) Statement of Environmental Effects prepared by Mackenzie Land Planning Services dated May 2006; and
 - i) Addendum to Statement of Heritage Impact prepared by Mackenzie Land Planning Services dated 25 January 2005.
- 2) Prior to commencement of work a S60 application shall be lodged with and approved by the NSW Heritage Council under the Heritage Act 1977.
- 3) The following documentation/information shall be submitted for approval together with a section 60 application:
- a) The design of the new timber framed link buildings require further design resolution in order to ensure that these buildings are compatible with the scale of the original secondary buildings extending from the veranda.
 - b) Details of all construction works including but not limited to the new services, new additions, carports and sun protection elements (louvers) and partitioning walls;
 - c) A detailed conservation schedule for the existing significant fabric both internal and external;
 - d) Details of the measures that must be taken to protect the existing fig tree (3440A) at the north-west corner of Ward 4 and other significant landscape features of the site;
 - e) Archival recording of the existing Wards and Superintendent's Residence, both measured drawings and photographic recording, in accordance with the relevant guidelines of the Heritage Office;
 - f) Detailed archaeological assessment of the proposed development in accordance with the detailed design of new services and other associated works;
 - g) Material sample board showing all internal and external finishes, materials and colours.

6. Development Application Referrals and Major Project Application Referrals Under Part 3A of EP&A Act

NIL

7.0 Matters for Consideration

7.1 St John's site, Morpeth – Pre-DA Update

This report was to inform the Approvals Committee about discussions held at a site visit to discuss the proposal to construct an 80 bed high care residential facility within the Closebourne House precinct, in addition to the 327 dwelling units already proposed. The site visit was attended by Michael Collins, Susan Macdonald, Bruce Pettman, Dianne Jones, Julie Bindon and Rajeev Maini of the Heritage Office. Notes of the site visit prepared separately by Rajeev Maini (Heritage Office) and Alan Croker (Design 5) were tabled at the meeting. The notes prepared by Rajeev Maini are to be distributed to the applicant as a record of comments made at the site visit by those members of the Approvals Committee who were in attendance on 7 June 2007. An aged care facility on some part of the site could be supported by the Approvals Committee, however it was believed a design with less bulk and mass would be more suitable. A sub-committee, comprising of those Committee members in attendance at the site visit, will be formed to advise the Approvals Committee with regard to further discussions with the applicant.

Resolved:

That the Heritage Council:

- 1. Note the report and resolves to form a sub-committee comprising those Heritage Council members who attended the site inspection on 7 June and the Executive Director, Heritage Office.**
- 2. Request the sub-committee to continue to actively engage with the proponent to ensure that the sub-committee's advice is encapsulated in any future application.**

7.2 Sydney Town Hall – Pre-DA

The City of Sydney is preparing to undertake upgrade works to the services throughout Sydney Town Hall and develop new service spaces in the basement Peace Hall in order to activate this space. The works will involve excavation below current ground levels and may require removal of highly significant human remains dating to the earliest European occupation of Australia. The project will seek approval to exhume likely human skeletal remains as part of the excavation works. The Committee would like to link any approval of this proposal to a re-activation of the nomination of the Town Hall for listing on the State Heritage Register.

Resolved:

That the Heritage Council notes the presentation by the Council of the City of Sydney:

- 1. that archaeological testing works will inform a forthcoming Heritage Council Section 140 permit application. The Heritage Council notes that archaeological remains of major significance could potentially be found which would impact on the proposal and its timing.**

2. that the development application for the substantive services upgrade and other works to the building will be forwarded for the Heritage Council's consideration in due course.
3. Requests that the Heritage Office, in conjunction with the Council of the City of Sydney, to progress the nomination of the Town Hall to the State Heritage Register in parallel with the consideration of the services upgrade and other works.

8.0 Matters for Information

8.1 Brewarrina Weir Fishway Update

The application was to construct a partial width rock-ramp fishway at the southern abutment of Brewarrina Weir immediately upstream from Brewarrina Aboriginal Fishtraps. Since the Approvals Committee resolution of 7 March 2007 the Heritage Office has met with both the applicant and Community Working Party to address concerns about the proposed excavation and potential impact on the riverscape and any remnant fishtraps.

On 21 May 2007 the Heritage Office received a letter from Adam Vey, Senior Conservation Manager Aquatic Habitat Rehabilitation at the Department of Primary Industries, advising that the Department of Primary Industries wished to withdraw the current S60 application.

The Approvals Committee noted the update report on the status of the application.

Resolved:

That the Heritage Council:

Note the Department of Primary Industries withdrawal of the S60 application for the construction of a partial width rock-ramp fishway at the southern abutment of Brewarrina Weir because the issues raised regarding the traditional and contemporary cultural values of areas within the footprint of the proposed fishway are unable to be appropriately addressed by the current design.

9.0 General Business

NIL

There being no further business the Chair closed the meeting 1:45 pm.

Michael Collins Chair Approvals Committee Heritage Council of NSW Date:	Next Meeting of the Approvals Committee 1 August, 2007 3 Marist Place Parramatta
--	--