

HERITAGE COUNCIL OF NSW

Approvals Committee



MINUTES OF MEETING

6 December 2006

Heritage Office, 3 Marist Place, Parramatta

-
- PRESENT:** Michael Collins (Chair), Peter Mould, Chris Johnson, Susan Macdonald, David Logan, Julie Bindon, Janet Dore, Jacqui Goddard
- APOLOGIES:** Diane Jones
- ALSO PRESENT:** Heritage Office: Vincent Sicari, Nikki Ward, Can Ercan, Murat Gul, Brad Vale
For The Chalet, Hunters Hill: Stephen Davies (City Plan Heritage), Stephen Collier (Stephen Collier Architects)
For Millers Point Post Office: John Tropman (Tropman & Tropman Architects), Giuseppe Calabrese (Tropman & Tropman Architects), Tim Greenland (Owner), Margaret Desgrand (City of Sydney Council)
For Caritas, Darlinghurst: Michael Harrison (Architectus), Tony Collier (Architectus), Paul O'Donnel (Graham Brooks & Associates)

1. Opening – Welcome

The Chair opened the meeting at 1:00 pm.

1.2 Confirmation and Timing of Agenda

The agenda was confirmed.

Declarations of Interest

Pecuniary Interests
NIL

Non Pecuniary Interests
NIL

Conflicts of Interest
NIL

2. Confirmation of Minutes

2.1 Approvals Committee Meeting of 2 November 2006

Members received a copy of the minutes.

Resolved:

that the Minutes of the meeting of 2 November 2006 be adopted.

3. Action Report

Members received a copy of the action report.

Resolved:

that the Action Report of the meeting of 2 November 2006 be adopted, with the inclusion of details on Rippon Grange from the 4 October Approvals Committee meeting.

4. Presentations

4.1 The Chalet, Hunters Hill – IDA

The Approvals Committee was shown a powerpoint presentation showing the current condition of The Chalet, highlighting it's appearance, fragile condition and the impact of termite damage in the older section of the house. The house has been treated for termites and Mr Simon Wiltshire (of Hughes Truman Pty Ltd - Consulting Engineers) has carried out an investigation of the site on behalf of the applicant. All timber has been examined and repair works scheduled in the CMP. The investigation concluded that it is possible to restore the building.

The proposal does not aim to build on the predominant garden area. However, the timber shed at the rear of the property is to be demolished. The shed is currently in a very poor, semi-collapsed state.

The original building does not afford suitable living space for contemporary family living. Rooms are too significant for conversion to bathrooms or as a kitchen; the remaining rooms tend to be small with many doors and frequently lead from one into another. These rooms are considered more suitable for use as guest rooms, studies, and entertaining rooms. The existing stairwell to the attic space is an uncomfortable access route. The precedent of using this space helps to justify the first floor walkway/link between the existing and new building. The attic will be used as a study.

4.2 Millers Point Post Office – Pre-DA

Tim Greenland (owner of the site), outlined the necessity of developing the site in order to ensure financial viability of the post office, as a business. To enable the Post Office to survive it would be necessary to open up the first floor of the existing building for use as commercial office space to help pay for running costs

of the Post Office and maintenance of the building. The first floor is currently used as the owner's residence. For commercial purposes, the first floor and the proposed new additional storey could be leased to the one tenant. Previously it has been difficult to lease the first storey rooms as larger, open spaces are preferred for such purposes. Mr Greenland would like to continue to live in the area, the proposal includes a new residential building the rear of the existing building.

John Tropman (of Tropman & Tropman Architects) explained that the proposed verandah extending out from the first floor of the existing building may later be needed as a kitchen and bathroom due to spatial demands. The existing roof structure would be braced and propped up, creating useable attic space. The outbuildings at the rear of the existing building would remain. Also, a gap between the existing and new buildings would remain to allow sunlight to continue to fall on the neighbouring church windows.

Margaret Desgrand (from City of Sydney Council) outlined the importance of maintaining views to the existing building from the north, east, west and above from Observatory Hill. The proposed first floor verandah to the existing building would impact unsympathetically on the silhouette and views of the building and openings to the verandah would impact on the significance of the current facade. Low scale, transparent development would be preferred. Also, Council prefer that the site wall, on the northern boundary, should not be built upon. Building design should either reflect the design of buildings currently in the area or be something modern, not a blend of the two. The height of the proposed development exceeds limits outlined in the City of Sydney 2005 LEP controls for development in this area. A CMP would be required for the site and Council require an Arborist's report on the extent of tree lopping or excavation adjacent to the root ball of the plane tree at the rear of the site. Appropriate setbacks from the site boundaries would be required, particularly in the north east corner.

4.3 Caritas, Darlinghurst – Part 3A Concept Plan

Michael Harrison (of Architectus) stated that the Caritas site is to be sold in order to finance development on the O'Brien site of St Vincent's Hospital. Previous plans for the Caritas site have been revised to reduce building heights, retain trees (with the exception of 2 trees), and remove the former kitchen buildings. The proposal involves demolition of the Caritas Rehabilitation Centre and rear extensions to Caritas House, removal of the brick wall above the original stone wall along Bourke Street, excavation for basement car parking, construction of new buildings and refurbishment/fitout of Caritas House and Cottage. The site would also be rezoned and reclassified as state significant for inclusion into the SEPP.

New buildings along Bourke Street would range from 4 storeys (near Caritas Cottage) to 7 storeys (on the corner of Bourke and Burton Streets). New buildings along Burton Street would be 7 storeys. Block F, along Forbes Street, would be 5 storeys.

5. Integrated Development Applications/Section 60 and 132 Applications/Section 140 Excavation permits

5.1 The Chalet, Hunters Hill – IDA

A proposal was made for the conservation of the house and construction of a new wing of one and two storeys to the rear with roof connection to the house. The Chalet is a particularly rare timber house prefabricated in Germany and erected around 1854. The house demonstrates fabrication and construction techniques that are distinct and likely to be unique in New South Wales. The layout and size of the house are not well suited to the expectations for a contemporary family home. Some extension is essential to provide added space for new services that could not be sensitively inserted into the existing house, and new space that would reduce the pressure on the existing house for alterations to adapt it for contemporary use.

The Approvals Committee considered the proposal, in general, to be acceptable. It was requested that further details of the proposal with regard to materials, skylights and the first floor walkway/link between the original and proposed new buildings be provided for further assessment.

Resolved:

That the Heritage Council provide Hunters Hill Council with the following advice and General Terms of Approval:

- 1. The bulk, form and siting of the proposed additions are regarded as an excellent response and provide for sustainable use of the heritage listed house.**
- 2. The works shall be undertaken in accordance with the following documents: Drawings 0504_DA_P01 to 0504_DA_P04, 0504_DA_SE01 to 0504_DA_SE10 dated May 2006; Conservation Management Plan by City Plan Heritage, June 2006; Heritage Impact Statement by City Plan Heritage, June 2006.**
- 3. All conservation works shall be supervised by a qualified and experienced heritage architect with demonstrated experience in documentation and site construction management of historic timber structures. Prior to the commencement of works the name and the details of the nominated heritage architect, including his/her experience in this kind of work, shall be submitted to the Heritage Office.**
 - a) Prior to the application for a Construction Certificate, a detailed schedule of works for the conservation of the building shall be submitted to and approved by the Director of the Heritage Office or her nominee. The schedule of works shall be prepared by the nominated heritage architect as identified in Condition 2 of this consent and include details of the proposed skylights.**
- 4. Detailed drawings of the proposal shall be included with the section 60 application.**
- 5. This permit does not cover the removal of any State significant relics.**

6. The Applicant must ensure that if substantial intact archaeological relics of State or local significance, are unexpectedly discovered during excavation, work must cease in the affected area and the Heritage Council of NSW must be notified in writing in accordance with 146(a) of the *Heritage Act, 1977*. Additional assessment and approval may be required prior to works continuing in the affected area(s) based on the nature of the discovery.
7. The Applicant must ensure that should any Aboriginal objects be uncovered, excavation or disturbance of the area is to stop immediately and the Department of Environment and Conservation is to be informed in accordance with section 91 of the *NSW National Parks and Wildlife Act, 1974*.
8. The Applicant must ensure that any excavation which has revealed Aboriginal objects should be referred to the Aboriginal Liaison Officer at the NSW Heritage Office (Ph.: 02 9873 8567) as well as the Department of Environment and Conservation.
9. Anything done pursuant to this approval must be specified, supervised and carried out by people with knowledge, skills and experience appropriate to the work.
10. A landscape plan must be submitted and approved prior to the application for a construction certificate.
11. An archival record of the Chalet, in accordance with NSW Heritage Office guidelines, is to be submitted to the Director of the Heritage Office for approval within 3 months of the completion of the works. The recording is to demonstrate the Chalet and its affected site before works, and during works to demonstrate methods of nineteenth-century construction.
12. An application under section 60 of the *NSW Heritage Act, 1977* must be submitted and approved by the NSW Heritage Council prior to work commencing.

5.2 Millers Point Post Office – Pre-DA

The proposal involves the construction of a new dwelling at the eastern end of the site and the addition of a rooftop level, and verandah to the post office building. The works to the post office will require the adaptation of the existing roof for the construction of the rooftop level, demolition of brick and sandstone sills on the eastern façade to allow access to the proposed verandah and alteration of the existing stair to include a flight of stairs for access to rooftop.

The Approvals Committee considered a new residential building could be acceptable in principle however the design would need further consideration. The proposed verandah and rooftop addition to the existing building were not supported and a CMP for the site would also be required.

Resolved:

That The Heritage Council provide the following comments to the applicant:

The Heritage Council:

1. Supports the adaptive reuse of the Post Office subject to the exclusion of the proposed verandah and rooftop addition to the Post

Office and in principle supports a new dwelling in the location shown. This in principle support is subject to the Heritage Council's consideration of all relevant information at the time of approval.

2. Considers that the detailed design of proposed dwelling is critical to the successful heritage outcome of the Millers Point Post Office. In this regard the Heritage Council:
3. Recommends further assessment of the outbuildings be undertaken to ascertain their significance.
4. Advise the applicant that a Conservation Management Plan be prepared to be included with the section 60 application.

6. Development Application Referrals and Major Project Application Referrals Under Part 3A of EP&A Act

6.1 Caritas, Darlinghurst – Part 3A Concept Plan

In November 2006 the Approvals Committee reviewed a Concept Plan referral that sought a combined approval for the redevelopment of two properties O'Brien building and Caritas site which are currently operated by St Vincent's Hospital. The level of documentation and heritage impact assessment were considered inadequate for assessing such a large-scale development. Therefore, an improved heritage assessment and more detailed design documentation were requested. The applicant has subsequently modified the proposal.

It is considered that the proposed demolition of some of the components of the site and the construction of buildings up to seven storeys high is likely to have a negative impact on the significance of the site and on that of the surrounding conservation area. Of particular concern is the visual impact of the height and scale of the proposed 7 storey building (block E) on the corner of Forbes and Burton Streets and 5 storey building (block F) along Forbes Street. Both of these buildings overlook the neighbouring walls of the Darlinghurst Gaol and may have a negative visual impact.

Resolved:

That the applicant be advised that:

1. The Heritage Council has reviewed the revised plans and continues to have concerns that the scaling of the development does not respect the surrounding heritage conservation area.
2. In particular, the Heritage Council considers that the scale of blocks E and F does not respect the scale of the Caritas building and the Old Darlinghurst Gaol, opposite. To address this, the Heritage Council recommends a reduction in the heights of proposed blocks E and F to a maximum of 4 storeys, with a commensurate reduction in the available FSR.
3. The Heritage Council notes that its recommendations are based upon a review of the limited heritage impact assessment and design

documentation to describe the proposal in its context supplied by the applicant.

4. Any future applications for the site should include a conservation management strategy that includes policies for managing the heritage values and context of the site, including retained heritage items.

7.0 Matters for Consideration

NIL

8.0 Matters for Information

NIL

9.0 General Business

NIL

There being no further business the Chair closed the meeting at 4:30 pm.

Michael Collins Chair Approvals Committee Heritage Council of NSW Date:	Next Meeting of the Approvals Committee 7 February, 2007 3 Marist Place Parramatta
--	--