

HERITAGE COUNCIL OF NSW

Approvals Committee

MINUTES OF MEETING

6 July 2011

Heritage Branch,
3 Marist Place, Parramatta



PRESENT: Peter Mould (Chair), Julie Bindon, Diane Jones, David Logan, Petula Samios (Heritage Branch), Giovanni Cirillo (Department of Planning & Infrastructure)

APOLOGIES: Colin Rockliff

ALSO PRESENT: Siobhan Lavelle (Acting Manager, Conservation Team)
Graham Williams (Heritage Branch - Minutes)
Rajeev Maini (Heritage Branch – Items 4.1 & 7.1)

1. Opening – Welcome

The Chair opened the meeting at 1:00 pm.

1.2 Confirmation and Timing of Agenda

The agenda was confirmed.

Declarations of Interest

Mr David Logan reminded the Approvals Committee of the involvement of his firm, Godden Mackay Logan Pty Ltd, in the preparation of a Conservation Management Plan (CMP) for Campbell's Stores, Circular Quay West, Sydney. (Presentation, item 4.1, discussion, item 7.1). The preparation of the CMP was undertaken for the property owner, the Sydney Harbour Foreshore Authority (SHFA).

Mr Logan initially advised the Committee of his firm's interest, due to the CMP preparation, at the Committee's meeting of March 2011, at which meeting the current proposal for adaptations to Campbell's Stores was first raised. It was noted at that meeting that the SHFA was not the applicant for adaptations to the State Heritage Register listed item. Mr Logan had left the March 2011 meeting prior to discussion of the proposal by the remaining Committee members.

Mr Logan sought the other Committee Members' views as to whether they considered his connection to the CMP preparation to be a potential conflict of interest. The Committee agreed that in order to avoid any perception of a conflict of interest that Mr Logan should not be present at the Committee's discussion of the altered proposal. It was further agreed, however, that Mr Logan could attend the presentation which was scheduled to be made before Committee discussions of the proposal.

2. Confirmation of Minutes of Meeting of 1 June 2011

Each Member had each received a copy of the draft minutes of the last formal meeting of the Approvals Committee.

The issue of a proposed development on the Graythwaite Estate formed a discussion item in the June 2011 agenda (item 7.1). In addition to this discussion at the meeting the Committee had given further, "out of session" consideration to the final wording of its resolution. The recommendation was made to include the following paragraph in the minutes of the meeting, in recognition of the addition resolution wording discussion.

The Approvals Committee considered amended wording for the proposed additional policies for the North West site out of session and agreed that the changes did not significantly change the intent of the additional policy for new development in this area.

Resolved:

With the addition of the above paragraph the Committee resolved that the Minutes of the meeting of 1 June 2011 be adopted.

3. Action Report

As part of the agenda papers each Members had received a copy of the Action Report, which detailed actions taken since the last meeting of the Approvals Committee.

Resolved:

That the Action Report (noting actions undertaken since the meeting of 1 June 2011) be adopted.

4. Presentations

4.1 Campbell's Stores, 7-27 Circular Quay West, Sydney. State Heritage Register listed item No. 01536 – Pre DA Presentation

Rajeev Maini of the Heritage Branch gave members a brief presentation as a visual reminder of the scheme which had initially been considered by the Committee at the March 2011 meeting.

Mr Graham Brookes of Graham Brookes & Associates led a presentation to the Committee on an amended proposal for the redevelopment of Campbell's Stores. Mr Brookes introduced Ms Christina Markham, representing Studio Internationale, the new architects for the amended proposal. Mr Philip Beauchamp attended the presentation on behalf of the proponents, the "Dockside Group". Ms Lucy Burke-Smith represented the Sydney Harbour Foreshore Authority as an observer.

5.0 Integrated Development Applications/Section 60 and 132 Applications/Section 140 Excavation permits

Nil

6. Development Application Referrals and Major Project Application Referrals under Part 3A of EP&A Act

Nil

7.0 Matters for Consideration

7.1 Campbell's Stores 7-27 Circular Quay West, The Rocks

Following the two presentations regarding the initial and modified proposals for Campbell's Stores, and as agreed previously by the Committee, Mr David Logan left the meeting at 1:55 pm. The remaining members then considered the amended scheme for Campbell's Stores.

The Heritage Council Approvals Committee initially considered a scheme for the redevelopment of the State Heritage Register listed Campbell's Stores at the meeting of 2 March 2011. The scheme had been presented to the Committee for its comments prior to a formal Development Application being prepared and submitted by the applicant. The major elements of scheme, as presented to the Committee in March, proposed;

- reconfiguration of tenancies and removal of current marquee-style outdoor additions;
- lowering of the 1980s promenade/forecourt;
- the addition of two-storey detached glass and steel veranda the length of the main eastern, harbour-side façade;
- new additions at the northern end and reconfiguration of the southern end;
- glass and steel entrance covers on the western, Hickson Road façade.

In its discussion at the March meeting the Committee agreed that it had no objections to the removal of several items dating from the late 1980s refurbishment, which include the raised "podium" on the harbour frontage.

The Committee had considered that the application of a glass and steel frame terrace canopy for the complete length of the harbour-side façade would make it harder to readily discern the architecture and rhythm of the bays of the stores building. The Committee agreed that the façade could be better appreciated if the canopy were not continuous.

The Committee also considered that the initial scheme's proposed use of glass panelling at the southern end of the stores would be excessive, whilst the proposed new north-end structure was also considered to be excessive in the use of glass elements in its design. Suggested solutions were recorded in the Committee's March resolution (points 3, 5 and 6, respectively).

The amended proposal, presented to the Committee, retained the continuous glass canopy on the eastern façade, at the level where the store's uppermost, brick-constructed level meets the lower sandstone structure. The initial proposal for a continuous first-floor restaurant veranda had been modified by the removal of the veranda sections from the façade at bays 1, 4, 8 and 11.

The initial proposal's plan for a glass canopy on the Hickson Road (western) façade had also been modified to provide for ten individual entry porticos to allow for weather protection of entrances, tenancy name signage, menu display and entrance lighting.

It was noted by the Committee that the contemporary design of the proposed, free-standing new building (Bay 12) at the northern end of Campbell's Stores was substantially changed from the initial proposal with less use of glass and substantial steel panelling on the northern and western walling.

The proposal for the southern end of the terrace had removed the free-standing glass panels that the Committee had considered at the March meeting as being excessive. The current proposal envisaged a glass-panelled lift and staircase in three flights and two landings to link the Hickson Road level with the harbour-side level. A large viewing deck, at the level of the upper landing, with an open cafeteria below the deck was also proposed.

In regard to the proposal for the main, harbour-side façade the Committee considered that the amended proposal still did not meet their requirement that nominated bays should be unimpeded of additions. Members specified that bays 1, 4, 7, 10 and 11 should be left completely free of all additions, including canopy, in order that the façade of these bays can be appreciated and the rhythm of the whole façade understood by the public. In nominating these bays it was noted that bays 1 to 10 form one early 19th century style, whilst bay 11 is in a contrasting style, although similar in scale.

Committee members agreed that the proposed supporting cantilever armatures, as main supports for the canopy and verandas, would be too heavy and dominant in appearance and as such these required further consideration by the proponent's architect. It was felt that these armatures should appear as light as is practicable and that the cantilever structure made the structure heavier than necessary.

Members also agreed that on those bays (bays 2, 3, 5, 6, 8 & 9) where a canopy and veranda could be acceptably accommodated no blinds or screens should be permitted. The committee considered that blinds or screens could visually clutter the view of these bays and would not be in keeping with the stated intention of the canopy and veranda sections additions being as minimalist in their appearance as is practically possible. Comment was made that the proposed glass elements, owing to the nature of the material, are likely to be reflective at times and as such affect the view of sections of the bays.

The committee found the amended proposal for the treatment of the Hickson Road façade entrances acceptable and raised no objection to this aspect of the amended proposal.

The Committee agreed that a new structure at the northern end of the terrace, in the location of Bay 12, should be physically separate from the Campbell's Stores terrace and it was noted that the amended proposal provided for this separation. The Committee did, however, agree that the design, materials and shape of the proposed new Bay 12 does not "fit-in" with the other buildings in this heritage area.

In regard to the proposal for new development adjoining the southern end of the terrace the Committee considered that the proposed stairway and platform extended too far-out from the terrace harbour-side façade. It was also felt that design treatment and dark brown colouring of the stairway and balustrades, as illustrated in artist's impressions, would render such additions as too "heavy" in their appearance and impact. It was noted that a toilet area is proposed at the ground-floor cafeteria area but that plans did not indicate whether disabled toilets are included.

It was also noted that the aspect of the proposal which envisages lowering the raised forecourt area, created in the 1980s redevelopment along the stores' harbour-side façade, was unresolved as regards a commitment from the Sydney Harbour Foreshore Authority, whether services may be located in the area and the responsibility for costs associated with removal.

Resolved:

That the Heritage Council Approvals Committee;

- 1. Note the presentations and the June 2011 agenda report;**
- 2. Note that the design has been altered since the Approvals Committee's resolution of 2 March 2011;**
- 3. Note that this proposal is subject to the lowering of the forecourt area and that at this stage, no commitment from Sydney Harbour Foreshore Authority has been received;**
- 4. Advise the applicant that the Heritage Council considers the following amendments would reduce the overall impact of additions on the heritage character of the eastern or harbour-side façade:**
 - a) the proposed roof canopy and verandas should not be continuous for the length of the harbour-side facade. Bays 1, 4, 7, 10 and 11, should be left free of additions to enable the architecture and rhythm of the heritage buildings to be interpreted;**
 - b) there should be no glass canopy between the proposed structure and the heritage buildings;**
 - c) the proposed supporting cantilever armatures are considered to be too dominant in appearance and require further design consideration for additions to appear as light as is practicable. In order to achieve this posts at the upper level may be acceptable;**
 - d) glass balustrades should be used at the upper level to ensure a transparent structure;**
 - e) the 3m deep cantilevered glass canopy, proposed to extend from the veranda structures, should be revised in favour of a lighter less visually dominant structure;**
 - f) the area east of the heritage buildings is intended for outdoor seating and should be treated as such. There should be no temporary or adjustable screens or shades attached to the proposed structures;**
- 5. Advise the applicant that the amended design of the entrance porticos on the Hickson Road façade is acceptable;**
- 6. Advise the applicant that the proposal to construct a new building on the site known as bay 12, separated from the bay 11 is supported. The amended design, however, in its proposed use of materials and shape is considered to conflict with the heritage character of the surrounding area, and this should be redesigned;**
- 7. Advise the applicant that although the concept of a new stairway, viewing platform and associated cafe/restaurant at the southern end of the Campbell's Stores terrace is supported, the Committee considered that the following elements require further design refinement:**

- a) **the stairway and viewing platform extend too far from the alignment of the Stores' harbour-side façade and should be reduced as much as possible**
 - b) **detailing of the stairway and its balustrades should be designed to have less visual impact;**
 - c) **the Committee noted that the plan for the ground level cafe area included a toilet area and sought further details as to whether provision for disabled toilets is included;**
- 8. Advise the applicant that if any archaeological or Aboriginal relics are found during any excavation for this project, the overall design may need to be amended if it was considered that those relics must be retained in-situ;**
- 9. Advise the applicant that, in due course, proposals affecting Campbell's Stores will be advertised by the Heritage Branch for public comment and all submissions and other information available at the time of assessment will be appropriately considered by the Heritage Council of NSW.**

8.0 Matters for Information

Nil

9.0 General Business -

There being no further business the Chair closed the meeting at 3:00pm.

Peter Mould Chair Approvals Committee Heritage Council of NSW	Next Meeting of the Approvals Committee 7 September Government Architect's Office Rawson Place Sydney
--	--