



P.J.P. MARINE

A DIVISION OF PJP CONSULTANTS PTY LTD
ABN 24 001 432 293

PO BOX 7 JANNALI NSW 2226

Tel: 02 9521 4990 02 9521 1322

Fax: 02 9545 1338

COMMERCIAL VESSEL DESIGNERS & SURVEYORS

PJPMarine "Baragoola"

25 June 2009

Mr Tim Smith
Deputy Director
Maritime Archaeologist
Heritage Branch
NSW Department of Planning
Locked Bag 5020
PARRAMATTA 2124

Dear Mr Smith

Peer Review of the "Boat Check" report provided to the NSW Heritage Branch

Background

PJP Marine have been requested to undertake a peer review of the report compiled by Mr Peter Kysil of "Boat Check" surveyors and valuers on the findings of his report on the vessel MV "Baragoola" to the Director of the NSW Heritage Branch.

The "Boat Check" report is seen as a present condition report of the vessel MV "Baragoola" and is not a true marine survey report which would consider other deficiencies and aspects of the vessel. PJP engineers recently undertook an external inspection of the hull condition prior to writing this report.

Whilst the report does cover the overall condition of the vessel's hull, deck and machinery systems on the vessel, it also provides a brief past history of its operation of the vessel as a Sydney ferry.

Whilst the vessel MV "Baragoola" does represent an early example of the double ended ferry design that was engaged in transporting passengers from Circular Quay to Manly through the early years of the Sydney Harbour passenger service, today it does not reflect an exact replica of what it once was, in that the vessel was originally a steam powered ferry with an open upper deck and its original machinery has all but gone.

The hull however, may be considered as a possible original good example of riveted steel construction and its design and build standard would be the only example of early Sydney Harbour ship building significance left today.

Her service as a Manly ferry is significant having been in continuous service since 1922 until the late 1970's. The listing by the Heritage Council of NSW by the issuing of a Permanent Conservation Order in 1989 should be considered at this time. A clear line of separation

must be determined as to the future of the vessel by its present owner and the NSW government authorities.

The “Boat Check” report does clearly demonstrate that the vessel is in poor condition, however this view is also expressed by the authorities and other interested parties.

Options

1. If it was decided to de-list the MV “Baragoola” from the State Heritage Register then the fate of the vessel would only be to wreck the vessel for scrap. This also presents a problem for authorities as the vessel cannot be **broken up** in its present **location**. This would only be permitted by the relevant authorities and would have to be moved to be broken up as scrap.
2. If the vessel remains on the Heritage List after June 2009 the State Government authorities and the present owner must decide upon its immediate future. As stated in the report the vessel is in **imminent** danger of **sinking at its berth**. NSW authorities such as the Port Authority, Foreshore Protection Authority and the NSW Maritime Authority along with the NSW Heritage Council, must meet with the present owner to finalise an **outcome** for this historic vessel **immediately**.

As also pointed out in the “Boat Check” report there would be substantial environmental impact should the vessel sink at the berth.

Conclusions

- (a) I have reviewed the “Boat Check” report and whilst it is somewhat disjointed it cannot be read as a marine survey report, however it does provide information that we would be in agreement with. I refer to paragraph 11 onwards where the author refers to the vessel’s hull condition.

PJP would fully support the view that this vessel is presently in imminent danger of sinking at its berth. We would concur with this assessment and therefore immediate action is required to determine the future of the MV “Baragoola”.

- (b) Should the vessel remain on the Heritage list then the NSW government authorities and the present owners **must prepare a risk assessment plan** (RAP) for its movement to a repair slipway to make the vessel safe and a suitable location must be found to store the vessel, possibly out of the water permanently.

A location such as the hard stand area on Cockatoo Island would be ideal where the vessel could possibly be viewed as an exhibit of early ship building in Sydney Harbour. As the NSW government is aware this site is managed by the Sydney Harbour Trust.

- (c) The cost of undertaking such a relocation program would however be estimated in millions of dollars, ie. :
- Phase 1 – Risk Assessment and Hull survey to make the vessel safe for towing and slipway permanent storage; the owner must seek permission to move the vessel from the Harbour Master/Harbour Control.
 - Phase 2 – To tow and locate the vessel on a hand stand, such as Cockatoo Island at the north western building slipway where cradles would be required to be fabricated to slip the vessel on a high tide. This facility is managed by the Federal Government under the Harbour Trust. Again permission must be obtained from the Harbour Master.

In our opinion no other location is available except the possibility of Homebush Bay where the vessel's funnel would have to be removed to allow it to pass under the rail bridge at Rhodes. A separate risk management plan would have to be approved by the Harbour Master's office for this to occur.

- (d) The de-listing of the vessel will in our opinion immediately force the authorities into having the vessel scrapped by the owners as it **will not be possible** to place the vessel back in class survey as a ferry or commercial vessel under U.S.L.
- (e) The "Boat Check" report covers all aspects of what the NSW Heritage Council requested.

Recommendations

1. The final decision must rest with the NSW government authorities and the present owners of the vessel MV "Baragoola" as to the future of the vessel. A clear decision must be made immediately.
2. That the "Boat Check" report be accepted as a fair assessment of the vessel's present unsafe condition.
3. We agree with the NSW Heritage Branch's justification for de-listing the MV "Baragoola" from the State Heritage Registrar of Historic Vessels due to the present unsafe condition of the vessel.

Yours sincerely

Peter James Pool
Senior Surveyor for PJP Marine
Member of the Chartered Institute of Marine Science
& Engineers

NB: This report has been completed as an independent review of the "Boat Check" report dated 13 February 2009 at the request of the Deputy Director of the Heritage Branch, NSW Department of Planning, and their senior Maritime Archaeologist.